

Teaching Communicating Skills for Civic and Democratic Health and Vibrancy:
Summary of Year #1 of CosmoKidz in k-2 classes in Hammond and Tickfaw,
Louisiana

Presented to Mindy LaBreck
Kettering Foundation

Kim Pearce, Co-Founder and President
CMM Institute
June 18, 2018

“Democracy requires a community or a society of citizens that can work together to address common problems.” Kettering Foundation

"As citizens we have to be more thoughtful and more educated and more informed. I turn on the TV and I see these grown people screaming at each other, and I think, well, if we don't get our civility back we're in trouble." Emmylou Harris

“He is a lot more aware of how he feels and how his actions towards others matter.” Parent of k-2 student at Woodland Park School

“I helped a sad baby.” Independence School Kindergarten Student

“I saw a girl fall and I picked her up.” Independence School First-Grade Student

“I am helping the old lady open the door.” Woodland Park School
Second-Grade Student

We are living in challenging times... and many say, “fractured communities.” The quote by Emmylou Harris points to an experience of incivility that has become more common than most anybody wants. And, unfortunately, it is not primarily confined to political pundits on cable news or talk show TV, but also in our daily experiences within families, schools, political circles, and social media, to name a few. Although Harris names part of the problem as incivility, she also names some of the solutions: *We have to be more thoughtful, more educated and more informed.* Harris’s list of remedies is an important one, but it leaves out another crucial skill set that the Kettering Foundation has identified that any diverse community and thriving democracy must demonstrate: *the ability to work together to address common problems.* Look around, however, and you will observe that “working together” doesn’t just happen, particularly in diverse communities living within a globalized world with incommensurate values and beliefs.

Consequently, the education Harris prescribes should not only focus on developing skills to help us become more informed citizens but also skills that help us to, for example, listen deeply and stay in the tension of hearing the beliefs of others that I really disagree with, while expressing my own beliefs in ways that keep the conversation going. These “soft skills” of communicating are what make the “brick walls” of controversy and difference possible to transcend. And, unfortunately, these skills are in short supply—not only are they *not* the norm in our society, but they aren’t taught with any depth or consistency.

One reason for this is the persistent taken-for-granted view of communication that has been the guiding paradigm in the West for over 400 years. This view of communicating focuses on idea/information exchange (imparting and conveying information). The attention and emphasis are on the ideas and the content being expressed rather than the process of communicating itself (the interactional turns that open up or close down possibilities for deep listening, understanding, respect, healthy disagreement, etc.). As long as we focus on ideas we will miss the relational dynamic that we are making in the back and forth of our conversational turns. If we want to co-create civility and work together to address common problems, we must, among other things, focus on the actual patterns of communication (and our part in co-creating these patterns) that make these ways of being possible. Young children in Hammond, Louisiana are learning how to do this, and they will tell you, as the opening quotes suggest, that they are helping a sad baby feel better, picking up a friend who has fallen, or opening the door for an old lady. Some parents will also opine, as the parent in one of the opening quote has, that their child is more aware of how s/he feels and how his/her actions toward others matter. Developing this kind of social sensitivity is a crucial building block for civic health and democratic engagement.

The Communication Theory, Coordinated Management of Meaning (CMM), has developed an array of tools, models, and heuristics to help us “see” how our social worlds are getting (re)made through our stories/perceptions and our joint actions. Barnett Pearce, a primary developer of CMM, has asserted that the form of communicating that is most needed in our contemporary society and often in shortest supply is Cosmopolitan Communication.¹ This form of communicating requires, among other things, a level of mindfulness that my stories, experiences, and perspectives are one of many possibilities and a level of curiosity about the stories, experiences, and perspectives of others who are not like me. The skills and abilities of Cosmopolitan Communication comprise awareness/mindfulness of our social worlds, deep listening, empathy, regulation of strong feelings and emotions, ability to handle conflicts and differences in productive ways, and a willingness to stay in the tension of conversations that are surfacing different, and sometimes incommensurate, experiences, views and perspectives. These are the “soft skills” that make the brick wall of controversy and difference possible to transcend and

¹ Pearce, W.B. (1989). *Communication and the Human Condition*. IL: Southern Illinois University Press.

that provide the ability for a diverse society and community to work together to address simple and complex problems. In other words, these communicating skills are essential for a strong and vibrant democracy.

The skills of cosmopolitan communicating also need to be taught and practiced over and over and over again. Their development requires the same commitment needed to master any ability or skill set. You must repeat the practice using thousands of “proper repetitions” until eventually the task is performed without conscious effort. The rationale for mastering a cosmopolitan communicating skill set is to counteract our current communication habits and practices that are stoking incivility, polarization, entrenched “like-minded” camps, etc. Additionally, if these skills are taught to young children, they will grow up knowing a much healthier way of being in the world with others. For them, civic education begins by practicing these skills with other children, their teacher and, ideally, their parents, siblings and others in their life.

With a goal of helping young children develop and eventually master these skills, the CMM Institute and an organization in Norway developed a set of conversational topics and activities that help children mindfully navigate their social worlds of teasing, sharing, making new friends, bullying, etc. together with the help of an adult. To the extent that children are able to name their thoughts, feelings, and emotions, listen to others, and coordinate useful ways forward, they have a better chance of creating more desirable social worlds.

We named these activities CosmoKidz. CosmoKidz comprises 31 topic areas (the topics were primarily chosen by children themselves) with each topic represented on a separate card. Every card includes the following: a topic; a typical scenario related to the topic; an illustration of the scenario on the other side of the card; questions to help the children meaningfully explore the topic; and, role play activities to help children act more productively into a similar future situation. The questions are meant to help children explore and name their own feelings and experiences (awareness/mindfulness), to imagine how other children might think and feel (perspective taking/ empathy), and to imagine and name how their actions might affect relationships with each other (agency/communication turns). We also developed an acronym SOAR and a SOAR song that the children can sing and dance to. SOAR stands for: **S**ense what’s around you; **O**pen your hands to help others; **A**ct with kindness; **R**espect other people. Teachers point out SOARing behavior throughout the day and encourage students to show this behavior to those around them. Additionally, the children are experiencing “modified deliberations.” These are conversations about a relevant social classroom topic which include three possible choices for how the situation might be handled. The children talk together about what they like and don’t like about each choice and, at the conclusion, the teacher leads a discussion about the possible trade-offs when one choice is decided instead of another. Children vote for their preferred choice before they deliberate and again after the deliberation has ended. This teaches them that it’s possible to

change your mind once you have heard what other people think and believe about the choices.

From 2014-2016 the CMM Institute and the Kettering Foundation partnered to test the effectiveness of CosmoKidz and modified deliberations in an economically and socially challenged school in my community of Oracle, Arizona. The research results were very encouraging; the children are learning and practicing cosmopolitan communicating with carry-over in non-classroom contexts including the playground and home-life. Some of the teachers have even expanded on CosmoKidz and modified deliberations even though I am no longer conducting research at the school.

The current research is replicating what was done in Arizona but now in the deep South of Hammond, Louisiana. CosmoKidz is being used in all kindergarten through second-grade classes in two schools; one is in rural Tickfaw (Independence Magnet School) and the other in urban Hammond (Woodland Park School). Both schools are k-8 and both are economically and socially challenged. The Principal of Woodland Park, Tangee Daugereaux, says this about her school:

“Woodland Park is located in the middle of an extremely impoverished area. The majority of our zone is comprised of the two largest projects in Hammond. Our precious students often go without the bare essentials that are needed to learn. The school is currently at 93% free and reduced lunch. Woodland Park was once a Pre-K and Kindergarten school only. Due to desegregation litigation in our parish, we were forced to change our configuration to become a k-8 school. This tremendous change took place just last year. After receiving our first LEAP scores for the first time, we learned that we are an F school. It was not a surprise, as most of our students are two or more grade levels behind. Many students come from a home environment that is not conducive to learning. They are stressed and often angry. They lack reasoning, good decision making and communication skills.”

Thirteen classes participated in this research—four kindergarten classes, five first-grade classes, and four second-grade classes for an approximate total of 230 students. The teachers received a day-long introductory training from two teachers from Arizona who have used CosmoKidz for several years and me about the purpose and goals of having conversations with their students about their social worlds and the requirements and expectations for the research. We also talked about deliberation and provided a role-play of the kind of modified deliberations they would be doing throughout the school year. Four college students attended the role-play deliberation and later helped with the three classroom deliberations by facilitating small group discussions with the children.

Every teacher was given a CosmoKidz set, a puppet with a happy face on one side and a sad face on the other to help the children identify emotions and feelings, and a SOAR poster to post in the classroom. The teachers were encouraged to be creative and have fun with their puppet and to choose topics in CosmoKidz that are relevant to what is happening in their class. They were instructed to have brief (approximately 10 minutes) but daily or almost daily conversations on a topic that is relevant for their students. I also asked them to remind the students of SOARing behavior and point out examples of the children SOARing (**S**ense what's around you; **O**pen your hands to help others; **A**ct with kindness; **R**espect other people). The two teachers from Arizona and I had email exchanges and conference calls with the Hammond teachers throughout the year as a way of staying connected with them and creating a supportive learning environment.

My data collection and analysis includes pre- and post-questionnaires from each teacher, monthly reports from teachers, an end-of-the-year survey from parents, an end-of-the-year SOAR recall test with examples of SOARing behavior from the children, flip chart notes of the three deliberations from each group, class, and grade level, observations from the college students about the changes in the students' abilities to deliberate, and my own observations of the children's interactions during a two-day visit at the end of the school year. The collated and tabulated results from the parent survey, the SOAR recall test, and the three deliberations are contained in the appendix at the end of this document.

My research questions are the following:

Research Question 1: To what extent are the kindergarten through second-grade children at Independence and Woodland Park Schools able to meaningfully discuss the topics in CosmoKidz?

Research Question 2: How does the use of CosmoKidz over the course of a school year affect their interpersonal communication skill sets and actions?

Research Question 3: How does the use of CosmoKidz over the course of a school year affect interpersonal communication skill sets and actions across contexts (outside of the classroom and at home)?

Research Question 4: In what ways does the use of CosmoKidz carry-over into a deliberative context? What communication skill sets are apparent as children deliberate topics related to their social world?

Research Question 5: What are the deliberative and communication skill sets that children are exhibiting in the first modified deliberation? How do these skills change overtime (as observed in the second and third modified deliberations) as children are using CosmoKidz daily in the classroom?

The rest of this summary will address these questions.

Research Question 1: To what extent are the kindergarten through second-grade children at Independence and Woodland Park Schools able to meaningfully discuss the topics in CosmoKidz?

One of the advantages of having 31 topics is the ability to pick and choose topics that are appropriate for each teacher's students. One of the observations that I heard from most of the kindergarten teachers is that some of the topics are too advanced for their students. Consequently, the topic selection for the kindergarten teachers was more selective. Additionally, one teacher captured what I heard from most kindergarten teachers: "Some questions are a bit above the kindergarten students' heads and must be modified to their level." One of the teachers solved this challenge by "sticking to one question...rather than move on to something I don't think they'd understand or that is repetitive." Most of the kindergarten teachers also expressed the redundancy of the questions across topic areas. Most of the questions ask students to reflect on their own thoughts and feelings, how they think other people might think and feel, and how relationships might be affected based on what people say and do. Some of the teachers found that the children were repeating the same answers across topic areas. This occurred during the first months of the school year. However, as the year progressed the kindergarten students began to make finer distinctions. For example, one teacher said, "...Their insights and ideas often surprise me by their depth. We are talking about jealousy this week and it's interesting indeed. What I am most pleased about is my students really GET that it's important to discuss feelings and solutions. This is more their go-to response to conflict." Another teacher remarked, "I can see a big difference from where my students were in the beginning of the year to where they are now, with at least 80% of my students showing improvement."

To summarize, the kindergarten students were able to discuss the topics of CosmoKidz but in a much more limited way than the first- and second-graders. The students are more limited in the CosmoKidz topics that affect them, and in their ability to speculate and imagine future possibilities. As one of the kindergarten teachers said, "We have great discussions. Their answers don't always make sense but the more I explore, I get great ideas from them on appropriate ways to act about certain things.... It's a process, but the children are five. It will take a while for things and ideas to stick and be commonplace."

There were no first-grade teachers that said the students in her class were unable to discuss the topics of CosmoKidz. Most of the teachers described how effective using their puppet was (happy face on one side and a sad face on the other side) in conversing with students about the CosmoKidz topic of the week. All of the teachers gave their puppet a name and a specific personality. When Sophie or Sunshine or Rainbow (examples of three puppets) appeared, the students knew they would be talking about a CosmoKidz topic and/or SOARing behavior, and they would end their discussion with the SOAR rap song and dance. One teacher said that during the first weeks of the school year, the puppet Sophie introduced SOAR and told the students what each letter of SOAR stands for. The teacher's observation was, "it was nice to see that even the little kids could understand and explain some of the meanings of SOAR." As the year progressed this teacher provided examples of how Sophie helped the children have

conversations about their own social worlds. For example, “Sophie was nervous about taking a bunch of tests. We read the card (about taking tests) and had some discussions on how to calm ourselves before test.” A few days later, “Sophie came back to visit to help stay calm and ask for advice on how to take tests. What strategies to use for math.” Another teacher described how much her “students love to act out with Sunshine” (her puppet). She provided an example during the first two months of using CosmoKidz when students began pushing and shoving on the rug. “Sunshine came out and the other kids yelled stop y’all are making Sunshine sad. The two kids who were pushing and shoving immediately stopped and sat on the carpet and stated, sorry Sunshine. Sunshine has a positive impact on the students.” These examples are consistent with the other feedback I received from the first-grade teachers. The puppets helped keep the children interested and engaged in the conversations of their social worlds. The puppets also became a learning tool for the teacher as the children sought to know what their classroom puppet thought and felt about what was happening in the class.

Similar to first-grade, there were no second-grade teachers who said the topics of CosmoKidz were above the heads of their students. One teacher said, “students are enjoying the lessons and are very vocal about their ideas, feelings and opinions.” This mirrored much of what I heard from the other second-grade teachers. Another teacher observed, “I loved to hear the students’ responses. They have experienced so many things that I wouldn’t have known about if it wasn’t for the CosmoKidz topics. They are usually very honest and love to reflect on their situations.” For example, when talking about the topic of “playing together and making choices” one teacher said:

“The students talk about this all the time, especially the girls. They stated that if one wants to play this and the other girls want to play that, they start to “bully” each other usually ending up in tears. This was an important lesson because it helps them to understand everyone doesn't always have to agree, but you have to learn to work together.”

Several months into the school year, another second-grade teacher said she noticed her students were becoming more thoughtful. This was also a theme that I heard from many of the teachers, especially as the year progressed.

Another way of answering this first research question is to observe the differences in the children’s behavior over time. If the children are able to have conversations about their social worlds that are meaningful, these conversations should carry-over into their interpersonal relationships. In other words, there should be visible changes in how the children interact with each other and behave in the classroom. This leads to my second research question:

Research Question 2: How does the use of CosmoKidz over the course of a school year affect their interpersonal communication skill sets and actions?

The data I gathered for this research question comes from the teachers and the students. Each teacher was given a pre-and post-questionnaire about their students’ behaviors and problem solving/decision making skills. I also received emails from teachers

throughout the school year about changes they were noticing from their students. Each student was also given a SOAR recall test at the end of the year. Additionally, students were asked to provide an example of something they did that exemplifies SOARing behavior. The composite results of the SOAR recall test can be found in Appendix A, pgs. 19ff.

Every teacher in this research said that using CosmoKidz made a positive difference in their students' behaviors and actions. The best way to capture the teachers' observations is to quote them directly. I am providing quotes that represent a general sense of what most all of the teachers said they observed.

Kindergarten Teachers and Students:

"Life happens" and this was true for some of the teachers at both schools. There was a kindergarten teacher at Woodland Park who went on maternity leave in February which created a challenging situation for the substitute teacher who didn't know how to use CosmoKidz. Consequently, one of the classes went through a two month stretch without having conversations about their social worlds. According to the teacher, there was a relearning of how the children can work through challenging and unwanted behaviors in this class. A teacher at Independence had surgery toward the end of the school year and, this too, created a challenge for the substitute teacher as she wasn't familiar with deliberations. Having said that, the changes in students' behaviors was still very positive.

In answering a question of what "interactional changes the teacher has seen during the course of the school year," one teacher said: "I have seen many acts of kindness and students trying to resolve their own conflicts amongst each other. However, due to their maturation level, there are some who still come to me first and others who do good things but still want/need my approval." This was a common theme among the kindergarten teachers: There is a lot of growth and positive changes in their five- and six-year-old students but also the need to constantly reinforce these positive behaviors. Another teacher said: "I have seen tremendous changes. My students know that the best course of action when there is any kind of dispute is to try to talk it out amongst themselves before they ever involve me in the conflict. I would gauge they resolve their own conflicts 70% of the time."

I also asked how often their students interact and play with children who are not like them. The kindergarten teachers told me that their students don't play with children from other grade levels and classes due to their young age. Consequently, most of the teachers didn't have much to say about this question. One teacher, however, said "This is a big hitter in my room. In previous years the students have teased those that are different or made rude comments. I have observed very little of this this year. The students welcome and play with those that are not like them."

Another teacher compared her students this year to previous years and told me, "I see a big difference in behaviors. My students who are CosmoKidz are much better behaved

and ready for first-grade.” She also said, “my students are not whining all the time as they were doing in the beginning of the year. They now talk things out.”

During the course of the year, I received emails from teachers with examples of their students’ behaviors. Here is a sampling from the kindergarten teachers:

“Since our week off from Spring break, we did a recap from the previous card—Act with Kindness. Before the holidays the students were getting pretty rowdy and careless. For example, when students bring class snacks for snack day and they are unwanted, some children made unpleasant remarks. Some students were saying things, not realizing they were hurting others’ feelings. I thought it would be a good time to review the Act with Kindness card and role play with two puppets. I asked the question, ‘How would you act or what would you do if someone gave you a gift that you really didn’t like?’ I accepted all answers and then began the role-play scenario. The students were able to see how feelings can get hurt and we discussed polite ways to accept gifts. I want my students to understand that they may not always get the things they want and that’s ok. We can accept them respectfully.”

From another teacher:

“I have a short story to tell about what happened yesterday. The whole class was out of sorts and had to be corrected many times during Math class. After math was lunch and recess. Some students lost some of their recess time. When we lined up to go to PE one of the little girls who is really well behaved said, Mrs. _____, when we go into the classroom I think Miss Ava (our puppet) needs to talk to the kids about behaviors. We need to do the SOAR song so we can respect others. She wanted to know if we had a card on talking too much.”

Another way of gauging the interpersonal skills and abilities of the students is their ability to recall what SOAR stands for and describe positive examples of SOARing behavior (**S**ense what’s around you; **O**pen your hands to help others; **A**ct with kindness; **R**espect other people). Every kindergarten through second-grade student was given a SOAR recall test at the end of the school year. The test was given in small groups with a college student overseeing the children as they took the test to ensure that each child answered the questions on his/her own. The results of the SOAR test reveal the following about the kindergarten students:

Independence school has one kindergarten class with a class size of 20 students. Eighteen students identified the correct answer of **S**ense what’s around you; 17 students said the O stands for **O**pen your hands to help others; 17 students correctly identified the A as **A**ct with kindness; and, 19 of 20 students answered **R**espect other people. Approximately 85 to 95 percent of kindergartners were able to identify what SOAR stands for.

The students were also asked to draw a picture of something they did during the week to show they were SOARing and to write a sentence describing what they did. The college students helped the kindergarten students write their sentence. Answers included (direct quotes), playing with my sister, getting a birthday balloon for a cousin, helping a sad baby, making a new friend on the playground and helping her feel better, helping a friend who had fallen on the playground, and helping a friend who had fallen out of her seat.

Woodland Park School has 53 kindergarten students. Of these students, 44 correctly identified the **S** and **O** in SOAR, 49 students identified **A**cting with kindness, and 47 students identified **R**espect other people, for an approximate total of 80% to 90% of positive student recall. The examples of SOARing behavior during the week included (direct quotes), a friend helping me pick up a drink I spilled and I said thank you, helping my teacher, giving a friend a present, helping my brother, helping my cousin get up off the ground, helping my mom cook, helping my mom clean the room, helping a friend who got hurt, and helping my mom pick up my toys.

First-Grade Teachers and Students:

A challenging situation occurred toward the beginning of the school year when one of the first-grade teachers was transferred to another school. The teacher who took over the classroom had to jump right into all of the demands of being a first-grade teacher in a new school, including participating in this research project. The teacher wasn't adequately trained about the research or how to use the cards and puppet, so she understandably struggled a bit more than the teachers who had received training. This teacher also reported at the end of the school year that she saw a significant difference in her students' ability to talk things out before she got involved. She commented, as did most of the other teachers, that it takes time and practice to get the kind of results that she began seeing as the year progressed. Another first-grade teacher said, "The kids are using problem solving skills and learning how to choose the best outcome. They are more aware of consequences and the implications if applied." A different teacher said, "I feel (these conversations) gives the students a chance to voice their opinion and realize that they are not the only one with the same concern. Also, I can discuss something that I may have noticed happening but the students are too shy to bring it up." I asked the teachers to tell me the kinds of changes they have seen in how their students handle conflicts. One teacher said, "The changes is (*sic*) the kids are aware of their peer's feelings. There have been times when they have apologized without being prompted. When there is a disagreement they have begun to simply talk it out." This was a theme I heard over and over again.

The students at Independence school had a 100% recall of **S**ense what's around you and **R**espect other people (17 of 17 responses). Sixteen of 17 students correctly identified **O**pen your hands to help others and **A**cting with kindness had the lowest recall at 14 of 17 students.

Their written examples of SOARing behavior included (direct quotes), helping my brother clean up, I put my hands out when someone fell, I am listening when you call

my name, I said hi to a friend and gave him a cookie, I saw a girl fall and I picked her up, and I opened my hands to help someone off the ground.

Of the 57 first-grade students at Woodland Park, 53 of them identified **Sense** what's around you, 54 correctly chose **Open** your hands to help others, 56 said **Act** with kindness, and 54 responded with **Respect** other people for at least a 90% recall. Fifty-one students provided an example of something they had done during the week to show SOARing behavior. Examples included (direct quotes), when we and David are not friends we talk it out, I respect my teacher, I respect my brother, I am sharing a ball with my sister, I helped my friend who fell on the playground, I like to help my grandmother cross the road, I help _____ with math problem because she did not know, and I helped mama clean by picking up the trash and toys.

Second-Grade Teachers and Students:

At the beginning of the year, I received similar comments about the behavioral challenges of the second-grade students. Here is a sampling from three teachers:

“Students lack the communication and social skills to interact with one another. Instead they push, hit, yell and snatch things from each other. The students also steal things from each other if they do not have something. They lack respect for others and things around them.... When a disagreement or conflict arises they do not know how to problem solve with each other or work things out. They hit, yell, snatch and steal things from one another.”

“About 90% of my day is spent redirecting unwanted behavior....my students aren't displaying unity. Their strengths are vocalizing their thoughts but their weaknesses are blaming each other without asking each other (ex. stealing their things), talking over each other and standing against each other.”

“So far, when there is a disagreement the students tend to start hollering at each other or snatching things.”

The end of the year observations could not have been more different:

“I've noticed their language towards each other has changed. They're more kind to each other. Now they are pointing out the good in each other.... They try to talk the conflicts out. I often hear them saying, 'Can we work this out?' before they approach me. They usually talk about or remove themselves from the situation.”

“Students are more willing to talk out problems instead of hitting.... They are kinder and more patient with each other.”

“They still struggle with the words to use when expressing their emotions. However, I have seen them improve on being aware of the fact that their actions can hurt other people and how it feels to be that other person in the situation. I guess you could say they have gotten better at sensing what’s around them and acting with kindness! They will use the phrases for SOAR when another student is using SOARing behavior.”

A second-year teacher said this to me in a one-on-one conversation:

“I taught 4th grade last year in an upper-class area. My second-grade students this year are better able to problem solve than my 4th grade students from last year. I attribute this to the conversations of CosmoKidz. I remember the first deliberation we did in which the kids were wild and unable to focus versus the end of the year where the kids are not only focusing but they are able to describe how their behaviors and actions affect how people think and feel. The kids are catching themselves before acting.”

A seasoned teacher who has been working with children for over 25 years said this about herself:

“One of the biggest changes in using CosmoKidz is on me. I am much more aware of how I am communicating with the kids. When someone comes to me with an issue, I now ask them ‘how does that make you feel?’ Once they tell me, I encourage them to tell the other person how they are feeling and to work out the problem. I am also using these cards at home with my own children. I am much more aware of my own feelings and thoughts and how to express them in healthy ways.”

This last quote is one of the unintended, but hoped for, outcomes of having these conversations with students. It doesn’t just change the students, but it changes the teachers as well. They become more sensitive to the social worlds of their students and more curious about how their students are thinking and feeling. It also becomes an invitation to become more aware of their own thoughts, feelings, and perspectives and how they want to act into the social worlds that are affecting them as well as their students.

Fifteen second-grade students at Independence took the SOAR recall test and the results are quite impressive. There was 100% recall on the S, O, and R of SOAR and 14 out of 15 correct responses for Act with kindness. Examples of SOARing behavior during the week included (direct quotes), helping a friend pick up books, acting with kindness to help homely people, helping my cousin when she fell on the ground, being respectful by helping my friend when he fell, and helping friends to be nice by helping when they need help.

Fifty-three second-grade students at Woodland Park took the SOAR test and their results were also very impressive. Fifty-one students knew that S stands for **Sense**

what's around you, 49 students correctly answered **Open** your hands to help others, 50 students identified **Act** with kindness, and 51 students chose **Respect** other people. The students identified 49 examples of SOARing behavior from the previous week. Here is a sampling (direct quotes): I gave my friend a card for being my best friend; I got my brother a trophy; I helped my friend with her homework; I helped my sister find her shoes; I am helping the old lady open the door; and, I helped my mom cook last night.

Research Question 3: How does the use of CosmoKidz over the course of a school year affect interpersonal communication skill sets and actions across contexts (outside of the classroom and at home)?

I received a window into the social worlds of many of the students after the first modified deliberation in September. The scenario for the deliberation involved a teacher who had students who were misbehaving. We gave the students three options for how the teacher might handle this situation and asked them to discuss what they liked and didn't like about the three options. Option #1 was call home, Option #2 was take away recess, and Option #3 was the misbehaving student and teacher talk it out. What struck me about this deliberation was that every grade-level, every class, and almost every group didn't like the option of calling home because the children said they would get a whooping. Only a handful of the 230 students said they liked the option because their parents could help them learn why it's important to listen to your teacher. Interestingly, these students overwhelmingly preferred the option of "talking it out," although they were afraid of what the teacher might say and do. This deliberation gave me a perspective about what might be happening at home... and it didn't seem to include healthy doses of parent child conversations. Having said that, I also realize that there is always much more happening (positive and challenging) in a home environment that one deliberation can never begin to capture. It did, however, make me curious to know if the children were having conversations with their parents about the CosmoKidz topics and if parents were noticing positive behavioral shifts from their child.

To better understand the answer to research question #3, parents were given a questionnaire at the end of the year and asked to fill it out and send it back to their child's teacher. The composite survey results from Independence and Woodland Park are itemized in Appendix B, pgs. 28ff.

Sixty-four parents or a whopping 40% return rate occurred at Woodland Park school and a 22% response rate, or 12 parents, responded from Independence school. The results are very encouraging and indicate that there is positive carry-over in the home.

At Woodland Park, more than half of the parents said their child frequently mentions SOAR or SOARing behavior and almost half of the parents said their child frequently points out SOARing behavior. Only one parent responded with "never" in both categories. For the question, "Is your child exhibiting SOARing behavior more than s/he was at the beginning of the year?", almost 80% said more frequently to **Sense** what's around you with only 2 responses of "not as much," about 70% said more frequently to **Opening** your hands to help others, and about 80% more frequently to **Acting** with kindness and **Respecting** other people. Forty-five out of 64 parents said

they talk about the CosmoKidz topic of the week with their child between 1-3 days a week, 17 parents talk with their child 4 or more days a week and only 2 said they never talk to their child about CosmoKidz. Thirty-nine parents also said that their child sings the SOAR song 1-3 days a week, 21 said their child sings SOAR 4 or more days a week and only 4 parents said their child never sings SOAR at home.

The questionnaire also provided the parents an opportunity to provide examples of differences in their child's behavior. Parents provided 53 examples (see Appendix B for the complete results). Here is a sampling of examples parents gave (direct quotes): She helps other people more; kinder, more respectful to others and willingness to communicate feelings; she expresses her feelings more often and wants to be more helpful; they have done a 360. Always lending a helping hand; my kids are learning not to argue and fight as much at home; she is more responsive to other people's feelings; he is more respectful and helpful; she has become more open to others and peers; he is more open to talk about what makes him upset and how it can be fixed; and, my child is helping more, he is being more respectful to others and he's putting others first before himself.

The 12 parents at Independence school said their child mentions SOAR or SOARing behavior sometimes (7 responses), four responded frequently while one parent said never. Half of the parents said their child frequently points out SOARing behavior, four said sometimes and two said never. For the question of their child exhibiting SOARing behavior more than s/he was at the beginning of the year, the range was 6 to 9 responses of more frequently. Four parents thought their child's behavior of respecting other people was about the same and two parents thought "not as much". Ten parents provided examples of the differences they are noticing in their child's behavior. Examples include (direct quotes): he's been more motivated to do good in general and act respectfully with other children and adults; since the beginning of the school year she has been more open and kind to others; and, my child helps more around the house and also with her younger sister. Although my child isn't always kind, I believe if the program continues it will have a great impact on her which will flow throughout our household. One parent noted that her child isn't "respecting her mama and being mean to her sister and brother and not following directions." However, this was the only example of unwanted behavior from the 76 parental questionnaires.

These results verify that there is carry-over at home and that most parents are talking with their children about the topics of CosmoKidz. Parents are also seeing positive changes in their child's behavior. But these behaviors need to be reinforced at home. A kindergarten teacher at Woodland Park emphasized the importance of parental reinforcement when she said:

"I think Cosmokidz made a difference in the way my students interacted with me and their peers primarily due to the fact that this positive behavior was modeled and practiced daily. However, my students are just five and six and need continuous reinforcement. I can only speak for myself being a kindergarten teacher of 23 years that we can make a difference in our students' lives for the most part, but we need support

from parents to follow through with the same kind of respect portrayed in the classroom. I have taught some wonderful children in the past who have grown into productive citizens in the community and some not so productive due to their home environment. I truly believe CosmoKidz is a program that can work if it is used consistently and effectively. I also think that my students in past classes could have participated in deliberations if they were taught to communicate with each other. Here at Woodland Park we have implemented a collaborative working environment among students which enabled us to be successful with deliberations. If we show children love and kindness, they will know how to love and be kind.”

Research Question 4: In what ways does the use of CosmoKidz carry-over into a deliberative context? What communication skill sets are apparent as children deliberate topics related to their social world?

Research Question 5: What are the deliberative and communication skill sets that children are exhibiting in the first modified deliberation? How do these skills change overtime (as observed in the second and third modified deliberations) as children are using CosmoKidz daily in the classroom?

I am combining these two research questions as they relate to one another. I will begin with the 5th research question and tie my observations from this question into the 4th research question.

The first deliberation was conducted in September before the children had received any exposure to CosmoKidz. None of the children or teachers had any experience with modified deliberations before September. The teachers and I collaborated to choose a topic that was relevant to their experience in the classroom; we chose the topic of a child misbehaving in class and three options for how the teacher might respond. The full summary and analysis of this first deliberation is in Appendix C, pgs. 33ff. To briefly summarize, the children were able to talk about what they liked and didn’t like about the three options of calling home, taking away recess, or talking it out with the teacher. As would be expected, there is a cognitive gap between the kindergarten and second-grade students; the kindergarten students struggled the most in their ability to say what they liked or didn’t like about an option. Having said that, some of the most insightful comments came from the youngest students. One kindergarten student said that what s/he liked about a misbehaving student talking it out with a teacher is, “they will think about not acting up anymore and it will make your heart feel sweet.” This student intuitively understands that talking it out can help modify unwanted behavior as well as help the child feel better emotionally.

Another observation across grades was that it was easier for the students to discuss what they didn’t like about an option rather than what they liked about it. When discussing what they liked about, for example, taking away recess, the children talked about what the

misbehaving child might have done to warrant taking away recess rather than why taking away recess might be a good solution for the teacher to implement to reduce the unwanted behavior. They found it easier to imagine the negative repercussions of the option rather than the positive benefits. The exception to this was the choice, “talking it out”. Students across all grade levels were able to make nuanced distinctions about the benefits of talking it out. Students imagined that they would feel better about themselves, the teacher would understand them better, they would have a better understanding of how to make better choices, and the punishment would be less severe than calling home or taking away recess.

My last observation about the first deliberation is that many of the students had a difficult time focusing. A second-grade teacher reinforced what I observed when I viewed the videotapes of the classes and small groups during the first deliberation. She said, “I remember the first deliberation we did in which the kids were wild and unable to focus versus the end of the year where the kids are not only focusing but they are able to describe how their behaviors and actions affect how people think and feel. The kids are catching themselves before acting.”

The second deliberation occurred in January, 2018 and about four months after the children had been using CosmoKidz (see Appendix D, pgs. 68ff. for the complete summary and analysis). The teachers were noticing that their students were tattling excessively so we decided to do a scenario that had tattling as one of the options to get a better idea of how the children are thinking about tattling. The scenario we set up involved two puppets fighting over a toy that they both wanted to play with. One of the puppets grabs the toy and won’t give it back. We asked the children to think about three possible options that the child without the toy could do: find someone else to play with; tell the teacher; or, talk it out with their friend. My observation of the second deliberation is that, overall, the children were able to provide a clearer rationale for what they liked and didn’t like about each option. Furthermore, they were beginning to name conflicting and competing outcomes that may occur based on what they do. This skill set will eventually lead to their ability to imagine “trade-offs.”

Of the three options, the children had the most to say about “talking it out” and, by far, they chose this above the other two options. Many of their responses clustered around the theme of “agency.” The children felt that if they talk it out they will be able to solve the problem, learn to be better friends, share the next time the situation occurs, and keep the first friend while also having other friends because talking it out “doesn’t mess up friendships.” They were also aware of the downsides of talking it out. Some children were concerned about the discomfort of talking; they mentioned being scared, being shy, or being unsure of what to say. Other children thought that their friend’s feelings might get hurt or their friend might not listen. So, although they saw the benefits of talking it out, they were also aware that talking to their friend could make things worse.

The third deliberation occurred in May, 2018 (the full report can be found in Appendix E, pgs. 115ff). Because the children had spent eight months having conversations about their social worlds using CosmoKidz, I wanted to see if the students could generate realistic options on their own, discuss the benefits of each option, and then decide on their favorite option. Some of the teachers were noticing that a few of their students

were saying hurtful things so we set up a scenario of two puppets being paired together for a class assignment. One of the puppets doesn't like her partner and verbalizes this to the other puppet. We asked the children to imagine what the puppet who had hurtful things said about him/her could do. I was in Hammond to observe this deliberation and I was very impressed by the ability of the children to stay focused, to generate their own options, and to articulate why they liked some options more than others.

Consistent with the first two deliberations, the students in every grade decided on "talking it out" as their preferred option. A noticeable difference this time around was the "perspective-taking" some of the students were doing as they tried to understand the reasons for the mean behavior. For example, some students said that the person might be saying hurtful things because he is jealous, or scared, or lonely, or has had other people say mean things to him. They thought that talking it out might allow these feelings to surface. Some of the students wanted to help the mean student take the point of view of others. For example, kindergartners wanted to tell the mean person to be helpful or "no one will want to play with him," first-graders wanted to talk to help the person understand that "they are hurting people's feelings," and second-graders wanted the mean person to understand that "it makes people feel sad and not want to talk to you." Although we cannot know for certain, I attribute the children's perspective-taking as a result of the eight months of CosmoKidz conversations in which perspective-taking is a consistent theme. One other observation that is noteworthy is that of all of the grades, classes and small groups in both schools, only one group (out of 39) thought being mean back was a preferred option. Interestingly, another group in that same class decided the best option was being nice to the mean person, even though the person had said hurtful things.

This leads to research question #4, "In what ways does the use of CosmoKidz carry-over into a deliberative context? What communication skill sets are apparent as children deliberate topics related to their social world?" The examples I have just given point to the carry-over from CosmoKidz conversations to a deliberative context. As the year progressed, children were able to articulate more clearly what they liked and didn't like about options, they spoke more often about "agency" (believing they could act in ways to help make a situation better), and a few of them were taking the perspective of others as they thought about the best course of action. One of the college student facilitators observed a noticeable difference in the students as the year progressed: "I saw and heard change in them. They would tell me what SOAR stands for and how they helped their teachers or friends before I could even ask them. Their little faces would light up while explaining to me what they would do if they were in that specific situation." Another college student facilitator said, "They can tell you what they do differently than before CosmoKidz and how they thought differently about certain situations." A third college student said, "What I love the most is when I'm out and about and run into some of them (students). The parents say how much their child loves it. The students will give me a hug and say when are y'all coming again."

I was also very impressed with the children's ability and willingness, overall, to stay focused on their conversation during this last deliberation. As would be expected, this was more challenging for the younger children than the second-graders but there was an

observable shift in every grade level in the children's attention span from the first to the third deliberation. Some of this is maturation regardless of CosmoKidz conversations, but I think some of it is also because of the conversations children have been having about their social worlds. These conversations open up new ways for children to think about what's happening in their social worlds—how issues affect them, their peers, their relationships, and what they and their peers can do to help make a challenging situation better. Consequently, they have more to say about what they like and don't like about options when they are in a deliberative context.

I conclude this summary by reminding the adults who are reading this, how difficult the interpersonal communicating skills are that the teachers in Hammond are attempting to model through their daily or almost daily conversations using the topics in CosmoKidz and SOAR. It is not easy for many adults, let alone young children, to sense what's around you, open your hands to help others, act with kindness, and respect other people. And yet, these children are providing examples of how they are SOARing as well as their preference for "talking it out." Many parents and care-givers are also noticing significant differences in their child's behavior at home. Any yet, these skills must be practiced and reinforced consistently before they become part of the "muscle memory" of interpersonal relationships. As these skills become a more natural and ingrained way of being in the world, these children will grow up able to deliberate the more complex issues our country and world face and do so in ways that invite others with very different perspectives to do the same. For now, these children will continue to learn about interpersonal competency through their CosmoKidz conversations and modified deliberations and the role that these competencies plays in their ability to be good citizens of their classroom by working together to address common problems in their social worlds.

Appendix A

SOAR Student Recall Test

Woodland Park Kindergarten Students

N=53 students

Note: Some students circled more than one answer or didn't circle any responses
This year you learned about SOARing behavior. What does SOAR stand for? Please circle the correct phrase for each letter in SOAR.

- S: Seek out a friend: **7**
 Sense what's around you: **44**
 Stand up straight: **4**
 Say you're sorry if you have hurt someone: **1**
- O: Only talk when you're called on: **2**
 Offer candy to your friends: **4**
 Open your hands to help others: **44**
 Own toys that you'll share: **5**
- A: Act with kindness: **49**
 Ask someone to be your friend: **2**
 Allow a friend to play with your toys: **1**
 Always look both ways before you cross the street: **0**
- R: Read when you can: **4**
 Rely on your friends for help: **0**
 Rest everyday: **3**
 Respect other people: **47**

Draw a picture of something you did this week that showed you were SOARing. Write one sentence to describe what you did.

Quoted Written Responses:

- My friend wasted his drink and I help him pick it up.
- My smoothie dropped and my friend helped me pick it up. I said, thank you.
- I helped my teacher this week.
- I helped my cousin get up off the ground.
- I helped my brother.
- I love mom flowers.
- I gave candy to Joey.
- I help others.
- I played with Aaliyah Traxler.
- I gave a friend a present.

- I can help people.
- I help my mom cook.
- I help my mom clean the room
- I help my brother clean their room.
- I help my mom cook.
- I help my dad and my mom do work.
- I help my mom pick up my toys.
- I help friend when they get hurt.
- I helped my sister.
- I helped my best friend.
- I helped my Amani.
- I can help.
- I help my friend up off the ground.
- I just love to help my mom clean the clothes.
- I help my friends up every time they fall at the playground.
- I helped friend.
- I help my friend.
- I help.
- I help someone up.

Woodland Park First-Grade Students

N=57 students

Note: Some students circled more than one answer or didn't circle any responses

This year you learned about SOARing behavior. What does SOAR stand for? Please circle the correct phrase for each letter in SOAR.

- S: Seek out a friend: **3**
 Sense what's around you: **53**
 Stand up straight: **0**
 Say you're sorry if you have hurt someone: **1**
- O: Only talk when you're called on: **4**
 Offer candy to your friends: **1**
 Open your hands to help others: **54**
 Own toys that you'll share: **1**
- A: Act with kindness: **56**
 Ask someone to be your friend: **0**
 Allow a friend to play with your toys: **1**
 Always look both ways before you cross the street: **2**
- R: Read when you can: **2**
 Rely on your friends for help: **1**

Rest everyday: **1**
Respect other people: **54**

Draw a picture of something you did this week that showed you were SOARing. Write one sentence to describe what you did.

Quoted Written Responses:

- I gave my friend my candy.
- I always talk it out when me and David are not friends we talk it out.
- When we were playing baseball in the field and I hit my cousin in her jaw and said sorry to her.
- Do you be my friend?
- This is a friend (drew a picture of two friends)
- I help my mom wash dishes.
- I had open my hands to the others to give them book bags.
- My sister and I had chips.
- My sister and my brother just got chips from the stand.
- I am sharing a ball with my sister.
- Me and my brother have cookies.
- I helped somebody when they falled.
- I loves to help people.
- I help him to fix a drink.
- I respect my teacher.
- I helped my mom clean the house.
- I respect my sister.
- I will help Bayron bring up water.
- I respect my brother.
- To others I open my hands.
- I helped my friend get up.
- I help my mom fold clothes.
- I help someone get up.
- I helped someone pick up their paper.
- I help my sister clean her room.
- I help my mom clean the house.
- Me and my sister played with our dog.
- I helped my friend and play ball.
- I help someone off the ground and she's my friend.
- My sister and me played games.
- I help my mom cook.
- I helped my friend who fell on the playground.
- We watching fireworks. I am making sure nobody get hurt.
- Me and my friends are sharing.
- Playing basketball with my friend and drinking lemonade.
- I help somebody read a book.

- I like to help my grandmother cross the road.
- I will help my mom.
- I will help a friend.
- I saw Darielle on the floor.
- I gave candy to someone.
- I help my sister with her homework.
- I was doing chores for my mom.
- I will always help my friend up.
- I help Danielle up when she was hurt. I love to help.
- I help my brother.
- I help Addison with math problem because she did not know.
- I helped mama clean by picking up the trash and toys.
- I helped my brother play all day.
- I gave my mom a gift for her birthday.
- I will play a new friend.

Woodland Park Second-Grade Students

N=53 students

Note: Some students circled more than one answer or didn't circle any responses

This year you learned about SOARing behavior. What does SOAR stand for? Please circle the correct phrase for each letter in SOAR.

- S: Seek out a friend: **0**
 Sense what's around you: **51**
 Stand up straight: **0**
 Say you're sorry if you have hurt someone: **2**
- O: Only talk when you're called on: **3**
 Offer candy to your friends: **1**
 Open your hands to help others: **49**
 Own toys that you'll share: **1**
- A: Act with kindness: **50**
 Ask someone to be your friend: **0**
 Allow a friend to play with your toys: **2**
 Always look both ways before you cross the street: **0**
- R: Read when you can: **0**
 Rely on your friends for help: **1**
 Rest everyday: **0**
 Respect other people: **51**

Draw a picture of something you did this week that showed you were SOARing. Write one sentence to describe what you did.

Quoted Written Responses:

- She was running and she had felled and I said you ok?
- Drelon fell off the monkey bars and hurt him. I helped him up.
- I helped my classmate Jerimiah.
- I helped my mom walk the dog.
- I help my mom to help my sister.
- I was listening when Ms. Cleo was talking.
- I helped my mom wash dishes.
- I sweep for my mom.
- I helped my friend.
- I helped someone who fell and hurt the ankle.
- I helped somebody at recess.
- I helped my cousin out of the mud.
- I helped somebody with my table.
- I saved a baby from the road.
- I got my brother a trophy.
- I have SOAR when another grownup came in.
- I will help people if they fall at school.
- I SOAR by helping my mom shop.
- I sense and open to other people.
- I will help my sister.
- I helped someone do their work.
- I help my daddy clean out the house.
- I helped someone when they fall.
- My brother was trying to find the baseball when I saw him. I helped him to find it.
- I help them up off the ground yesterday.
- I help my dad clean out his car.
- I helped my sister up and fixed her tablet.
- I helped my friend up.
- I help my friend with her homework.
- I help my mom cook last night.
- I help the turtles cross the road.
- I helped a friend. She... (couldn't understand the rest of the sentence).
- I helped my friend cross the street.
- I gave my friend card for being my best friend.
- I am helping my friend get up.
- I am acting with kindness.
- I am sharing with my friend.
- I respect other people (picture of child saying, yes teacher).
- I help my sister with her homework.

- I helped my mom fix the car.
- I help my sister find her shoes.
- Say sorry. She is mad at me.
- I helped my friend.
- We can share the chalk.
- We can share the ball.
- I help my friend pick up books.
- I am helping the old lady open the door.
- I helped my friend get up off the ground.
- I help my friend pick up paper.

Independence Kindergarten Students

N=20 students

Note: Some students circled more than one answer or didn't circle any responses

This year you learned about SOARing behavior. What does SOAR stand for? Please circle the correct phrase for each letter in SOAR.

- S: Seek out a friend: **0**
 Sense what's around you: **18**
 Stand up straight: **2**
 Say you're sorry if you have hurt someone: **0**
- O: Only talk when you're called on: **1**
 Offer candy to your friends: **2**
 Open your hands to help others: **17**
 Own toys that you'll share: **2**
- A: Act with kindness: **17**
 Ask someone to be your friend: **1**
 Allow a friend to play with your toys: **0**
 Always look both ways before you cross the street: **0**
- R: Read when you can: **1**
 Rely on your friends for help: **0**
 Rest everyday: **1**
 Respect other people: **19**

Draw a picture of something you did this week that showed you were SOARing. Write one sentence to describe what you did.

Quoted Written Responses:

- I love my family.

- I played with my sister.
- I got my cousin a balloon for her birthday.
- I played with my friend.
- I helped a sad baby.
- I made a new friend at the playground and made her feel better.
- I help my friend when she fell at the playground.
- I help my friend at the playground.
- I helped my cousin get unsick.
- I opened my hands to help others.
- I helped my friend when she fell out of her seat.

Independence First-Grade Students

N=17 students

Note: Some students circled more than one answer or didn't circle any responses

This year you learned about SOARing behavior. What does SOAR stand for? Please circle the correct phrase for each letter in SOAR.

- S: Seek out a friend: **1**
 Sense what's around you: **17**
 Stand up straight: **0**
 Say you're sorry if you have hurt someone: **0**
- O: Only talk when you're called on: **0**
 Offer candy to your friends: **0**
 Open your hands to help others: **16**
 Own toys that you'll share: **1**
- A: Act with kindness: **14**
 Ask someone to be your friend: **2**
 Allow a friend to play with your toys: **0**
 Always look both ways before you cross the street: **0**
- R: Read when you can: **0**
 Rely on your friends for help: **0**
 Rest everyday: **0**
 Respect other people: **17**

Draw a picture of something you did this week that showed you were SOARing. Write one sentence to describe what you did.

Quoted Written Responses:

- I tell the teacher.
- I helped my brother clean up.

- I put my hands out when someone fell.
- I helped my friend up when she fell.
- I was playing football with my friend.
- I am listening when you call my name.
- I played tag with my friends.
- I played jump rope with my best friend.
- I was helping him get up.
- I said hi to a friend and I gave him a cookie.
- Helping some.
- I open my hands to help.
- I helped someone up.
- I saw a girl fall and I picked her up.
- I opened my hands to help someone off the ground.
- I helped my friend get cookies.

Independence Second-Grade Students

N=15 students

This year you learned about SOARing behavior. What does SOAR stand for? Please circle the correct phrase for each letter in SOAR.

- S: Seek out a friend: ☐ **0**
 Sense what's around you: **15**
 Stand up straight: ☐ **0**
 Say you're sorry if you have hurt someone: ☐ **0**
- O: Only talk when you're called on: ☐ **0**
 Offer candy to your friends: ☐ **0**
 Open your hands to help others: **15**
 Own toys that you'll share: ☐ **0**
- A: Act with kindness: **14**
 Ask someone to be your friend: ☐ **0**
 Allow a friend to play with your toys: ☐ **0**
 Always look both ways before you cross the street: **1**
- R: Read when you can: ☐ **0**
 Rely on your friends for help: ☐ **0**
 Rest everyday: ☐ **0**
 Respect other people: **15**

Draw a picture of something you did this week that showed you were SOARing. Write one sentence to describe what you did.

Quoted Written Responses:

- I help with friends to be nice by help when they need help.
- I helped my friend with picking up all of the books.
- I was nice to the boy.
- I was helping Robert get up.
- He is sensing what is around him (has drawn a picture of a boy looking both ways before crossing the street)
- I'm acting with kindness to help the homely people.
- I helped my friend by making sure he wasn't hurt.
- I help my friend get up.
- I help my cousin. I help her up when she fell on the ground.
- I have open my hands to help others. I watch out for my friends.
- I was helping Bre get up.
- I was being respectful by helping my friend when he fell.
- I am been nice because I gave her a toy.
- I help my friend when he fell.
- I been so nice to other people and I respect other people.
- I been so nice by helping my friend Jamayah.

Appendix B Parental Survey Results

Woodland Park School K-2 results

N=64 40% response

1. Since the beginning of the school year, is your child *mentioning* SOAR or SOARing behavior?

Frequently: 42 Sometimes: 21 Never: 1

2. Does your child *point out* SOARing behavior? (For example, saying something like, “She is opening her hands to help others”)

Frequently: 33 Sometimes: 30 Never: 1

3. Is your child *exhibiting* SOARing behavior more than s/he was at the beginning of the school year?

Sensing what’s around him/her (Being more aware of his/her surroundings)

More frequently: 50 About the same: 12 Not as much: 2

Opening his/her hands to help others (being more helpful)

More frequently: 46 About the same: 18 Not as much: 0

Acting with kindness (showing more kindness towards others)

More frequently: 54 About the same: 8 Not as much: 2

Respecting other people (showing more respect towards others)

More frequently: 54 About the same: 10 Not as much: 0

4. How often do you and your child talk together about the CosmoKidz topic of the week from your child’s class?

Four or more days a week: 17 One to three days a week: 45 Never: 2

5. How often does your child sing the SOAR rap song at home?

Four or more days a week: 21 One to three days a week: 39 Never: 4

6. Since the beginning of the school year, what differences are you noticing in your child's behavior?

Direct Quotes:

- Amazing child.
- He's more active.
- She's more helpful.
- She helps other people more.
- She has become the mother hen of the classroom. Always helping the kids and making sure that they are ok. Very kind hearted.
- Kinder, more respectful to others and willingness to communicate feelings.
- His attention span is way better.
- She expresses her feelings more often and wants to be more helpful.
- He's wanting to help more.
- He is more open to talk about his feelings. At the beginning of the year he would act out at home. Now he talks to my nephew about helping others.
- She has started to want to help people and always want to donate to people when she can.
- A change in attitude.
- She always talk about her teacher and school.
- They have done a 360. Always leading a helping hand.
- Helping other people. Respect for others.
- He is treating his brother and sister a whole lot better and he has started helping his papa out.
- She love school and her teacher. She is excelling in her education.
- He is open with talking about everything.
- My kids are learning not to fight and argue as much at home.
- She is more responsive to other people's feelings. When she hears someone being rude or ugly to someone else she would tell them that it is not right and talks more about God. How unhappy God is or would be because of someone being rude or mean.
- She is kinder to her little sister.
- He is more respectful and helpful.
- She is more attentive to other people's feelings—empathy.
- He's a lot more aware of his surroundings. I don't know if SOAR talks about healthy food choices but he always ask "is this healthy?" He thinks about others and what he can do to help.
- He is more aware of how he feels and how his actions towards others matter.
- That she is treating her classmate with respect and kindness. She is a very big help with her classmates.
- It has improved a lot.
- He has the best manners and have never received a red.
- He loves CosmoKidz
- My children's behavior is great now.
- She has become more open to others and peers.

- She is becoming more open to others.
- He is reading and writing very well.
- She loving interacting with other children. She always organizing with playing with others. She makes sure everyone is being fair.
- She is more willing to help others. She tries to teach her younger cousins.
- More manners and polite.
- He is more open to talk about what makes him upset and how it can be fixed.
- He's always been a caring kid so I haven't noticed much of a difference.
- He says please and thank you. He helpful and respect authority.
- He's understanding how to share and to be quiet when others are speaking.
- More respectful.
- She has been learning how to help others more.
- My son is more confident and loves to help others more.
- More helpful
- He interacting more with his peers.
- She has improved a lot.
- He has been more understanding of others and thinks before he reacts more frequently. Thank y'all for the program.
- She's being more helpful around the house. More respectful and her attitude has improved.
- More happy. Interacts much better with his friends/classmates.
- More positive outlook on things.
- My child is helping more, he is being more respectful to others and he's putting others first before himself.
- Being more respectful, helping others.
- She has been very attentive and have been paying more attention in class. The program has been real helpful.

Independence School K-2 Results

N=12 22% response

1. Since the beginning of the school year, is your child *mentioning* SOAR or SOARing behavior?

Frequently: 4 Sometimes: 7 Never: 1

2. Does your child *point out* SOARing behavior? (For example, saying something like, "She is opening her hands to help others")

Frequently: 6 Sometimes: 4 Never: 2

3. Is your child *exhibiting* SOARing behavior more than s/he was at the beginning of the school year?

Sensing what's around him/her (Being more aware of his/her surroundings)

More frequently: 8 About the same: 2 Not as much: 2

Opening his/her hands to help others (being more helpful)

More frequently: 9 About the same: 2 Not as much: 1

Acting with kindness (showing more kindness towards others)

More frequently: 8 About the same: 2 Not as much: 2

Respecting other people (showing more respect towards others)

More frequently: 6 About the same: 4 Not as much: 2

4. How often do you and your child talk together about the CosmoKidz topic of the week from your child's class?

Four or more days a week: 0 One to three days a week: 8 Never: 4

5. How often does your child sing the SOAR rap song at home?

Four or more days a week: 0 One to three days a week: 9 Never: 3

6. Since the beginning of the school year, what differences are you noticing in your child's behavior?

Direct Quotes:

- Humbleness
- She's opening up more than she have since the first of the year.
- Kindness. More respectful.
- Kindness.
- He has been more motivated to do good in general and act respectfully with other children and adults.
- Since the beginning of the school year she has been more open and kind to others.
- He is opening up more and being much, much more outgoing.
- Her attitude changed got to work on herself and learn how to act accordingly.
- Not respecting her mama and being mean to her sister and brother and not following directions.

- My child helps more around the house and also with her younger sister. Although my child isn't always kind I believe if the program continue it will have a great impact on her which will flow throughout our household.

Appendix C

First Modified Deliberation Summary

September, 6-8; 19, 2017

Executive Summary

During the month of September, thirteen kindergarten through second-grade classes at Woodland Park School and Independence Magnet School experienced their first-ever modified deliberation. The deliberations occurred before any of the students were introduced to the scenarios and conversations of CosmoKidz. This first deliberation is serving as a “base-line” of the children’s ability to talk about what they like and don’t like about three possible options based on a scenario. We are interested in observing how the children’s ability to have these conversations changes over time as they have daily conversations about their social worlds using CosmoKidz.

The teachers chose the scenario “disruptive behavior,” thinking that this would provide useful information about how the children are currently thinking about the topic. The three possible options were chosen because they are realistic possibilities for how a teacher might respond. We set up the scenario in this way: The teacher is trying to teach her students and a college student who is in the classroom is being disruptive. The teacher finally stops what she is doing and tells the class how frustrating it is to have someone interrupting while she is trying to teach. She asks the students to imagine how difficult it is for her when they interrupt. She tells them there are many things she could do to redirect unwanted behavior but she wants them to think about three possibilities and what they like and don’t like about each option. The three options are: 1. Call home; 2. Take away recess; 3. Talk it out (disruptive student and teacher talk).

The children were asked to secretly vote for their first choice before the deliberation. After their secret vote, the students were put into small groups² and asked what they liked and didn’t like about each choice. All small group facilitations were moderated by a college student. Each college student captured the children’s answers on flip chart notes that I transcribed. After the deliberation, the children secretly voted again. A detailed summary is provided in this document of the transcribed flip chart notes, the pre- and post-vote tallies, and my analysis of each grade level.

The summary notes in this document begin with the classes and grades at Woodland Park School, starting with kindergarten and ending with the second-grade classes. Each grade has its own document summarizing the results from that grade-level. The summary notes from Independence Magnet School follow my summaries of Woodland Park. However, because Independence only has one kindergarten, one first-grade, and one second-grade class, I have included and analyzed all three grade-levels in a single document.

² Due to a lack of available college students, the first-grade class at Independence Magnet School did not break into small groups and, instead, had a whole-class discussion of each choice.

Although I have provided an analysis from each grade level, there are two unexpected findings that jumped out at me that occurred across grade-levels that bear mentioning in this Executive Summary. The first is the frequency of the same response when the children talked about what they didn't like about the option of "calling home" (or when discussing the downside of parents finding out some other way that their child had misbehaved). This response occurred in both schools, in every class, every grade and almost every small group. Of the twenty-eight small groups across the two schools, twenty-six of the twenty-eight groups said the same thing or something similar—they didn't like the option of calling home because they were afraid of getting a whooping. Other similar responses were fears of being spanked, smacked in the face, or getting the belt. This research project involves parents throughout the school year through three Parents and Pizza nights. We have already had one event at each school with more than 400 parents and children involved. Based on our contact with the parents, some of my questions are: Might we offer deliberations for parents based on information we are learning from the children's deliberations that will benefit both parents and their children? For example, how might we meaningfully involve parents in thinking about the advantages, disadvantages and trade-offs of, for instance, different forms of punishment? What role should the school play, if any?

The second unexpected finding was the way some of these young children described what they liked about the "talking it out" option (this was also the choice that received the most votes per grade-level in both the pre- and post-voting). For example, five-year olds talked about liking this option because they will feel better about themselves, they will have a better understanding of how to act in the future, and the punishment will not be as severe as the other options. The most remarkable comment from one of the kindergarten groups was, "they (the misbehaving child) will think about not acting up anymore and it will make your heart feel sweet." Six-year olds discussed that they will learn what to do and how to behave, they will learn to listen, and they will be better in class. Seven-year olds liked this option because they (the child) can explain their behavior and apologize, they will feel better about themselves, and the teacher can offer advice and help them be better.

Having said that, most of the classes also expressed fear of the unknown when talking it out with a teacher. They were afraid that the teacher might still take away their recess or other privileges, or call their parents. Some groups said they would be scared, embarrassed, mad or sad if they talked with their teacher. The fear of these possible consequences made me wonder how often these children have had an opportunity to have a productive conversation with an adult about unwanted behavior that hasn't included the possible consequences that they talked about? If these children are having brief but daily conversations with their teacher using the topics in CosmoKidz, might this help these children experience a higher ratio of the benefits of talking it out without the fears they have expressed? How might productive conversations with their parents about the CosmoKidz topic of the week help parents and their children have more productive conversations? These questions create possibilities that we haven't considered in our prior research that I wonder about exploring. Doing this begins to expand the social system to include deliberative opportunities for the parents and children based on what we are learning from the children.

Woodland Park Kindergarten Classes

Number of Kindergarten Students: 49
Four College Student Facilitators

Class #1

Group #1

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- My mom would give me a break
- You'll get to stay home
- I would lose recess
- We can see our friends the next day
- I don't want the teacher to yell at me

What I don't like:

- Your mom would whoop you
- Because I like getting happy faces
- You'd get in trouble
- You'd get punished

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- Playing with friends
- Having fun
- Being outside

What I don't like:

- You're gonna be late
- You'd have to put your head down
- I'd be sad
- You'd get a time-out (said by two students in this group)

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- You won't miss recess
- You won't have to put your head down
- Because I want to go home
- I can play games instead

What I don't like:

- Your teacher will be sad

- You'll be upset
- It's not gonna be a happy talk
- You'll get put on yellow
- Move your clip to red

Group #2

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- Because you're being bad in school and it will get you in trouble
- Because you didn't raise your hands
- Because you weren't listening
- You will get in trouble and get a whooping and learn a lesson

What I don't like:

- You will be sad
- I don't want my grandma to be mad at me
- I don't want to get a whooping

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- Because you were hitting
- Because you were not paying attention during clean up
- You weren't raising your hands
- No ice cream
- The teacher will be able to talk

What I don't like:

- Your teacher will take your money out of your backpack
- You will get yellow and red
- Your teacher will call parents and they will tell you to clean up your room
- You will get in trouble

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Her telling you to be good
- You get to talk about choices
- You can learn a lesson

What I don't like:

- You don't want to get a whooping
- You will have to clean up and you'll get in red
- You'll have to sit in time-out
- You will lose your friends

Group #3

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- I wouldn't do it again if my teacher called home

What I don't like:

- I'd get a whooping
- No T.V.
- No playing outside once I'm home
- My parents would still think I'm good at school

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- Not having to sit with the teacher

What I don't like:

- No recess means staying in the classroom
- I can't play with friends
- My recess is taken away

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Talking with the teacher means no calls home
- Recess isn't taken away
- The teacher will know why I'm not listening
- Talking to the teacher can help the student to not be in trouble again

What I don't like:

- I don't want to talk
- She will be mean
- The person in trouble will be sad

Class Vote for Kindergarten Class #1

Before the Deliberation:

Call Home: 5

Take Away Recess: 4

Talk it Out: 7

*One student didn't vote a second time

After the Deliberation*:

Call Home: 6

Take Away Recess: 4

Talk it Out: 5

Class #2

Group #1

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- If you call home you will be good and not bad anymore
- It will teach the students to act better in class

What I don't like:

- Because you get in trouble. You are supposed to come to school to learn and be smart
- I will get a spanking
- You will get punished
- You will get expelled from school

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- Because they won't be able to have fun with the other students
- They will get laughed at and kicked out of school

What I don't like:

- Don't like getting in trouble
- I love to play
- I will feel sad

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- It makes me feel better
- I wouldn't want to be bad anymore
- They will be happy afterwards
- They will think about not acting up anymore and it will make your heart feel sweet

What I don't like:

- It wouldn't be fun to do that
- Maybe she would be mad at me

Group #2

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- If a student gets a phone call from school after they are punished they wouldn't misbehave in class again
- Following rules gives you a lot of dots

What I don't like:

- I'd get a whooping
- I'd get a talk from mom
- I wouldn't be able to watch T.V.

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- Instead of recess you get to sleep on a bench

What I don't like:

- You can't see your friends
- I'd be sad

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- We wouldn't be put in time-out
- You'd get to see your friends at recess
- You can have fun in class
- No whoopings at home
- You'd earn a dot on your name chart

What I don't like:

- Someone would be mad

Group #3

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- I might want to go to sleep
- I can play with my toys

What I don't like:

- They will get mad
- You will get a whooping
- I might get punished
- My mom will get angry
- My mom might whoop me
- I won't have to go to the office

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- You'll be in the heat all day if you're playing outside
- You'll be bored and won't want to play
- The playground might be wet and you'll trip over something

What I don't like:

- You might get mad
- The teacher might call your mom

- It will be a bad thing

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I don't want a phone call home
- I'd like to tell her the truth
- I might get a treat
- It's the best choice

What I don't like:

- I might be scared

Class Vote for Kindergarten Class #2

Before the Deliberation:

Call Home: 5

Take Away Recess: 3

Talk it Out: 9

After the Deliberation:

Call Home: 4

Take Away Recess: 5

Talk it Out: 8

Class #3

Group #1

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- Because they will get a red and get a whooping
- Because I want to be home
- Because he will get in time-out and in trouble

What I don't like:

- I will cry and be sad
- Your mom will send you to the room
- Because I wouldn't be able to play outside
- My mom will use the belt on me

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- Because he's always talking and it will be a good idea to learn his lesson
- It will make you pay attention more

What I don't like:

- You wouldn't be able to play on the slide
- Because you love recess so much
- People will laugh at you for being bad

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I love my teacher so much
- The teacher will let you move your clip from being bad to good
- The teacher will praise me

What I don't like:

- I don't want to be punished
- I'll be mad because I know she will call my mom
- Because she will keep asking why I was being bad and making bad choices

Group #2

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- Be able to ride a bike
- Being able to watch T.V.
- I wouldn't do what I did to get in trouble again

What I don't like:

- Get whoopings
- No T.V.
- I'd get punished
- No going outside
- Read good behavior books
- I'd have to sleep with the night light

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- I would earn recess back
- I would start listening to my teacher so I can play

What I don't like:

- I would rather have recess
- I can't see my friends
- I would be sad, crying mad

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- If we talk it out she might let me go to recess
- The teacher will know what's wrong when I tell her
- I won't get grounded
- I'll get to the play centers
- No one would be on blue

What I don't like:

- The student will be scared
- Student would be mad because student name (??)

Group #3

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- I don't want her to take my recess
- I'll be happy

What I don't like:

- Because I'll be sad you'll get in trouble
- Keep my happy face
- You might get a whooping
- I can't play at home

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- I'll get my recess back
- It will help me be good

What I don't like:

- I might cry
- I won't get to play
- I won't have any more recess
- I'll be mad
- I won't get to play with my friends

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I'll feel better
- I won't get in trouble
- I'll get a happy face
- I'll get moved up to pink
- I'll keep my recess
- I'll be happy

What I don't like:

- I'll be sad and mad
- I'll get in trouble

Class Vote for Kindergarten Class #3

Before the Deliberation*:

Call Home: 7

Take Away Recess: 6

After the Deliberation:

Call Home: 7

Take Away Recess: 5

Talk it Out: 1

Talk it Out: 4

*two students didn't vote before the deliberation

Analysis

Overall, these kindergarten students have the cognitive and verbal ability to engage in this activity. The students moved between a first- and second-person position as they talked about what they liked and didn't like about each choice. For example, sometimes they talked about how the choice would affect them (first-person) if they were being punished for misbehaving in class (i.e., I would...) and other times they talked about the choice more generally (second-person, i.e., you would...).

They were inconsistent in their cognitive ability to think about what they liked about a choice but could easily talk about what they didn't like about the choice. This happened for the first two choices, "calling home" and "no recess" more than the third choice of "talking it out." For example, instead of talking about what they liked about "no recess" as a choice, they primarily talked about how a student might be misbehaving to create the "no recess" situation. They also provided reasons why a teacher might call home; for example, "because you're being bad in school" or "you aren't listening."

A few of the students talked about the trade-offs of having one option over another, even though that wasn't a question that the College Students asked. For instance, some children liked the option of "calling home" or "talking it out" because they could still keep their recess at school. They were anticipating what wouldn't happen if only one of the choices was implemented. Some of the students, however, had a difficult time keeping the choices mutually exclusive. For example, some of the children thought that "talking it out" might also include a call home to parents or loss of recess.

Across the three classes, the students didn't have trouble talking about what they didn't like about each choice. A consistent theme for the first choice of a "call home to parents" was not liking the punishment that would await them. Most groups talked about whoopings and having privileges taken away. Some of the groups also expressed the emotional consequences of this choice—parents and grandparents being sad and angry. The clear downside of this choice, however, was punishment.

Their dislikes about the "no recess" option were more social in nature; not getting to play, not being with friends, being made fun of. A few groups also expressed sadness at not being able to play, but the clear downside of this choice was social and relational separation.

Overall, their reflections about the "talking it out" option were the most nuanced of the three choices. What students said they liked about this choice were feeling better about themselves, the teacher understanding them better, the student having a better understanding of choices, and the punishment not being as severe as the other two options. One student made a beautiful statement that is amazing for a 5 year old: "They will think about not acting up anymore and it will make your heart feel sweet." What the students didn't like about this choice were the fears of the unknown (how would they be punished?) and feeling sadness and anger. One student said s/he didn't want to talk.

Primarily it was the unknown aspect of talking it out that students were most concerned about.

All three class votes changed by a few votes between the first round (before the deliberation) and the second round of voting (after the deliberation). The vote changes affected the outcome in one of the three classes. This class had the most votes for “talk it out” in the first round and had the most votes for “calling home” after the second round of voting (this choice won by one vote). A second class voted both time for “calling home” as the first choice and a third class voted both times for “talking it out” as a first choice. What we don’t know about the voting process is how the children made their decision and whether the class exercise of talking about the three options affected their vote the second time. What we can say about the first deliberation, however, is that these children can do this activity.

Woodland Park First-Grade Class

Number of First-Grade Students Represented in this Summary: 47

Class #1

Group #1

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- Teacher could be calling the parents to say how much the student has improved
- Student would be able to go home
- After student gets in trouble at home he/she would know not to get in trouble at school again

What I don't like:

- Student would get punished at home
- Get sent to the office
- Your name clip will be changed to red
- I'd get a whooping

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- Wouldn't get in trouble again
- Student will start to listen
- Can talk it out

What I don't like:

- I'd be mad
- The name clip would be changed from yellow to red
- I'd get in trouble with parents
- I'd be embarrassed

- Student would have to stand in the sun with the arms crossed

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Teacher wouldn't call parents
- You won't get a whooping
- You'd start to learn
- Your name clip won't change
- The student will know not what to do

What I don't like:

- Parents won't know
- The teacher is upset because she knows students can do better
- I'd be scared to talk with the teacher

Group #2

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- I would rather talk it out with my teacher because I will listen next time

What I don't like:

- I might get a whooping
- My parents will take my toys away
- I might get punished
- I won't get ice cream
- I might get on red
- I will get put in the corner

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- I will feel happy because I don't want to play
- I would rather talk it out with the teacher

What I don't like:

- I will feel sad and cranky
- I will be mad
- I won't get to play with my friends
- I will feel angry

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I will get my recess
- I will be better!
- I will get to play with my video games at home
- When I go home I can get gummy worms
- I won't get in trouble again

What I don't like:

- I won't get in trouble with my parents
- I won't get money from my parents
- I won't get ice cream

Group #3

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- The student will be good afterwards
- They will yell at you and you will come back to school and listen
- They will learn their lesson and come back to school acting better

What I don't like:

- My mom will bring me home and whoop me
- You will cry
- I don't want my mom to whoop me at home and punish me

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- You're not supposed to talk while the teacher is talking
- You're being a smart mouth to the teacher and not paying attention
- Because the student is being a bully

What I don't like:

- Because I love it and I deserve to play with my friends
- Someone may have lied on me and said I hit them when I didn't
- I feel that she is being mean to me

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- She will explain why not to be bad anymore and we wouldn't go home and get in trouble
- Because I love her
- She will tell me right from wrong

What I don't like:

- She might be mad at me
- I don't know if she will talk nice or mean to me
- It will make me feel sad

Class Vote for First-Grade Class #1

Before the Deliberation:
Call Home: 4

After the Deliberation:
Call Home: 3

Take Away Recess: 3
Talk it Out: 9

Take Away Recess: 1
Talk it Out: 12

Class #2 (all small group flip charts were combined in this class)

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- His mom will whip him so he won't bother anyone
- Still gets to play at recess
- My mom won't answer phone so I won't get in trouble
- Don't have a phone
- I don't get in trouble anyway and I can still play with my friends

What I don't like:

- Get a spanking
- Can't play with my friends for a long time
- Have to talk to mom and te te
- Get feelings hurt
- None, should not have not listened
- Don't have to talk to teacher

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- No call home
- Don't have to talk to teacher
- No whooping
- Still get my phone
- Go outside when I get home
- Rest
- Don't have to play with kids I don't like
- Stay in the shade

What I don't like:

- No exercise
- Can't play with my friends
- Too hot
- Bored
- Not fun watching kids play
- Kid will still be moving every where
- Get in more trouble
- Bothering me

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I get recess
- Won't call mom so I won't get in trouble
- Mom won't know
- I still play outside
- Learn to listen
- Warning, to do better
- I like talking to my teacher
- Get exercise at recess
- Don't get a whipping
- Still have my phone

What I don't like:

- Don't like talking
- Teacher scares me
- Feelings get hurt
- Might cry
- I upset my teacher
- Take away from playing
- Remember what I did wrong
- All my friends will hear what I did wrong
- I'd be embarrassed

Class Vote for First-Grade Class #2

Before the Deliberation:

Call Home: 3

Take Away Recess: 5

Talk it Out: 9

After the Deliberation:

Call Home: 6

Take Away Recess: 7

Talk it Out: 4

Class #3

Group #1

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- Because the parent will take better care of it than the teacher
- You will get in trouble and learn your lesson
- Parents will spank you and you will never want to do it again

What I don't like:

- You will cry and have to stay in the room and not do anything
- I will be punished and grounded
- Because when it's your birthday you won't be able to swim and get in the pool

- I will be angry and sad

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- They are being bad and rude
- For not paying attention and listening to the teacher

What I don't like:

- It wouldn't be fun to just sit in class and watch them play
- I would have to stay inside and I will feel sad
- Because it was friends being bad and not me

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- So the teacher can take care of the situation
- I wouldn't feel lost and sad
- So I wouldn't act bad anymore

What I don't like:

- I might be nervous
- I wouldn't want her to call my dad
- I will be scared to talk to her because I know I wasn't being good

Group #2

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- Getting a call about being extra good or a change in behavior
- Student will have learned their lesson after getting in trouble at home

What I don't like:

- Get a whooping
- Sent to your room
- Make me go to sleep
- I can't play with electronics and TV
- Get to go home

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- Having fun with friends
- Playing on the slide
- Playing hide and seek

What I don't like:

- I don't like to get dirty
- Can't go outside when it's raining

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Makes me feel better
- Show the teacher students care a lot about her
- Tell the teacher they will listen and be good
- I won't get a call home

What I don't like:

- I won't get recess taken away
- I'd be mad

Group #3

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- Maybe I'll learn my lesson
- I won't have to go to pact (this is for kids who are bad)
- At least my clip won't get moved
- I'll go to sleep

What I don't like:

- I'll feel angry
- I'll get a whooping
- I'll get sent to my room
- I won't get to play outside

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- I won't bump into anyone
- I wouldn't want to get hurt at recess
- I want to stay on purple
- It's too crowded

What I don't like:

- I will feel mad and sad
- I will miss my exercise

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I'll get to keep my clip up
- I wouldn't want to get in trouble
- So I can get it out of my system
- I'll get to keep recess
- I won't get punished
- I'll feel better about myself

What I don't like:

- If I don't talk it out, I won't get it out of my system

Class Vote for First-Grade Class #3

Before the Deliberation:

Call Home: 0

Take Away Recess: 8

Talk it Out: 6

After the Deliberation:

Call Home: 0

Take Away Recess: 8

Talk it Out: 6

Analysis

Overall, the children in these first-grade classes have the cognitive awareness to discuss what they like and don't like about the three options. As is the case with the other grades and classes during this first deliberation, some of their responses didn't quite fit the option. For example, one group liked the option of calling home because the teacher could tell the parents how much their child has improved; they didn't connect that the call home was for misbehaving. This isn't a surprise given the developmental cognitive abilities of young children.

The most nuanced conversation occurred when they discussed the "talk it out" option so I will begin with this choice. Consistent with the other grades, these students discussed the pros of "talk it out" using two primary categories. A first category is lack of punishment. Students liked this option because there wouldn't be a call home, or no physical punishments, or lack of recess. By far, however, they liked this option for the benefits to themselves. These benefits included starting to learn what to do and how to behave, learning to listen, being better in the class. The benefits also included emotional—"feeling better about myself", "not feeling lost or scared" and getting the issue "out of my system."

Their concerns about this option were emotional in tone: being scared, sad, embarrassed, mad, and unsure how the teacher would respond. Without knowing what the children were thinking, I wonder how they would describe what they are mad and sad about and whether any of these emotions connect with not knowing how the teacher will treat them in the conversation? One group was concerned that the teacher would be upset. Having said that, I am amazed that some of these six year olds are expressing how an action (talking it out) will help them work through a difficult situation with an adult (teacher) with results, for example, being that they will feel better about who they are and they will learn to listen.

When discussing the "missing recess" option, the students said they liked the option because they would start to listen, they wouldn't get a call home, they would still have their phone, and they could still play at home. The most frequent reason for not liking the choice was emotional. Several groups said they would be mad and sad if they missed recess. Some groups expressed anger for being unfairly punished (two groups thought they might be punished for something that someone else did). Two groups were

concerned about not being able to play with friends and one group said they would be embarrassed.

The final option, “call home” had the benefits of encouraging them to be a better student, to learn their lesson and to know what they should not do in the future. There were three categories for why they didn’t like this option. The first category, and the biggest reason, was punishment at home. There were two types of punishment that they didn’t like. By far, the first type of unwanted punishment was whoopings. The students also talked about privileges being taken away as a second form of punishment. They said that their toys and phones would be taken away and two groups said they wouldn’t be able to play with friends. A second category for not liking this option was repercussions at school. The students thought they would also get sent to the office and “get on red”. The third category was emotional pain—hurt feelings, anger and sadness. It is unclear whether these are feelings that the students would feel, their parents would feel, or both.

I was struck by these six-year-olds’ ability to identify a range of nuanced benefits and concerns and their ability to identify difficult feelings across the three options. What we don’t know is if this translates into an ability to vote for their preferred option. One of the three classes had no vote changes after the deliberation and chose “take away recess” as their preferred choice. The other two classes did have vote changes; one class changed their preferred choice after the deliberation from “talk it out” to “take away recess” and the other class kept their preferred option of “talk it out” although votes did change from 9 to 12. We don’t know to what extent the deliberation affected how the children ultimately voted.

Woodland Park Second-Grade Classes

Number of Second-Grade Students: 59

Class #1

Group #1

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- Because they were being disrespectful
- Because they aren’t listening and paying attention while the teacher is talking
- Acting out in front of friends

What I don’t like:

- I’d be scared, afraid and sad
- I’d be mad because I know I will get punished
- I will be mad at myself

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- Because she was acting up in class calling people names like you're ugly
- Because she was interrupting the story
- She was being bad and fighting so she doesn't deserve to play

What I don't like:

- Because she is a good girl and my friend and I will be lonely on the playground
- Maybe she didn't do it and it was the wrong person the teacher caught
- She doesn't deserve to have it taken away for one mistake

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- She will make me feel better and good
- She would tell me to calm down and take 3 deep breaths
- Because it's a nice thing to do

What I don't like:

- I will be scared
- I wouldn't want to tell the truth on why I did it
- Maybe someone else did it and blamed it on me so I wouldn't want to talk because I don't think she will believe me
- Maybe the class won't want to talk it out with the teacher

Group #2

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- I will be nice next time
- You'll get a good report
- I'll go home and stay forever

What I don't like:

- I will cry
- My mom will yell at me
- I will get a belt whooping
- I will get punish work
- My mom will make me stay with someone
- My dad will tell me to get it together

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- Because I deserved it
- I can write a letter telling the teacher I'm sorry
- Next time I will be respectful
- I will do what the teacher says next time

What I don't like:

- I will feel sad
- I will miss playing
- I will miss having fun
- I will feel angry
- I'll feel left out

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I don't want to get a call home
- Because I won't miss recess
- I won't get in more trouble
- I'll listen to the teacher
- I'll tell the truth

What I don't like:

- I'll be embarrassed

Group #3

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- Student gets to go home
- If teacher calls home and the student is punished afterward the student wouldn't get in trouble again
- Getting punished will make students follow the rules and help the teacher

What I don't like:

- If parents get a call the student will get in trouble at home
- My dad will be called
- I'd be punished
- I couldn't play outside
- I'd get sent to the office

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- I wouldn't be tired if recess is taken away
- Can call parents to pick you up

What I don't like:

- I'd be sad
- I wouldn't be able to play with friends
- I would have to sit with the teacher outside
- I might have to walk around the playground until recess is over

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- The teacher might change her mind about punishment
- The teacher will give the student a second chance but if you still don't listen than she will call the parents
- I'd be happy because of no punishment
- The student tells the teacher to call parents and tell them how well they are doing in class

What I don't like:

- I'd be sad and scared because my parents might find out
- The teacher will make the student move their clip to red
- The teacher will feel embarrassed
- The teacher will be sad because she knows the students could do better
- The teacher might get fired if the Principal sees all kids on red

Class Vote for Second=Grade Group #1

Before the Deliberation:

Call Home: 8

Take Away Recess: 8

Talk it Out: 1

After the Deliberation:

Call Home: 6

Take Away Recess: 6

Talk it Out: 5

Class #2

Group #1

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- I'll run away and hide
- I'd rather get in trouble with the teacher
- I would want to get on green

What I don't like:

- I will feel scared
- I will get in trouble in front of the class
- I'll have to go to pack (this is for kids who are bad)

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- The teacher won't call your mom
- I wanna talk it out
- I don't want to make the teacher feel sad

What I don't like:

- I will feel sad
- I will get a whooping

- I like to play outside

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- If the student talks to the teacher then they would listen and do what the teacher said to do
- If the student talks to the teacher and they discuss what is wrong then they won't get in trouble
- If the student apologizes to the teacher and starts to listen then the teacher will move the name clip back to a good color and might give a treat

What I don't like:

- If the student doesn't listen after the talk with the teacher then they will get sent to the office
- The teacher will make the student apologize to the student who told a story and got them in trouble
- If the student doesn't tell the teacher about an altercation then it will keep happening
- If the student doesn't listen to the teacher after the first time, then the student will still get a punishment

Group #2

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- The teacher will call the parent to talk about how well the student is doing
- If parents get a call from the teacher about bad behavior, then the student wouldn't get in trouble again

What I don't like:

- The student will get punished
- Their name clip will be changed to red

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- Because he's being bad and being mean
- I feel he doesn't deserve it because he's acting up in class

What I don't like:

- I wouldn't be able to play with my friends
- Because it's not nice
- I'll be embarrassed

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- It will make me be more good in class
- She will tell me some good advice
- It won't be that bad to just tell her. She will know what to say so you won't do it anymore

What I don't like:

- Because I'm shy
- Because it was a really bad thing and I wouldn't want her to be mad at me
- Maybe she would tell me something that I shouldn't do but I still didn't listen anyway
- Maybe she will call the Principal and get me suspended

Group #3

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- He's not paying attention while the teacher is teaching a lesson
- He won't listen to the teacher
- Because he's being disobedient and causing a distraction

What I don't like:

- He might not be able to play when he goes home
- Your parents might get mad and whoop you in front of everyone
- Might be embarrassed in front of the class
- Mom might come to the school and spank me in the restroom

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- If recess is taken away the student has time to think about what they did wrong
- If recess is taken away then you try to act better and maybe the student can earn recess back

What I don't like:

- May get a write-up if recess is taken away
- You will be bored while everyone is playing
- The student will be mad and upset

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I will tell the truth
- You can earn a clip on green
- She won't tell my parents
- I won't get a call home

What I don't like:

- You might get in the corner

Class Vote for Second-Grade Class #2

Before the Deliberation:

Call Home: 6

Take Away Recess: 12

Talk it Out: 3

After the Deliberation:

Call Home: 2

Take Away Recess: 3

Talk it Out: 16

Class #3

Group #1

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- He was interrupting the teacher
- Because he wasn't following the rules
- The parent has more control over the student
- Because he was being disrespectful

What I don't like:

- They might whoop him
- Because they will get in trouble
- The student will have to go to pack

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- She must not really care about it if she's being bad
- So she can learn to be good and not act bad
- Because she wasn't following directions in class

What I don't like:

- Because it will be mean and hurtful
- Because he wouldn't have time to play
- His friends and classmates will want to play with him but he can't because he's punished

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Talking it out is good because she wouldn't take away your recess or call your mom
- Because he wouldn't get in trouble
- It will be nice because they will learn their lesson

What I don't like:

- Because we will still get in trouble and our parents will be called. We weren't listening to the rules
- The teacher might put you in the corner and make you stand up
- Because I might have a bad attitude

Group #2

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- I'll play videogames at home
- We can explain our side to our parents and think about it
- Go home and eat all day

What I don't like:

- I would be punished
- I wouldn't go anywhere
- I'd get a whooping or have to go to the office

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- You can spend more time in the classroom
- You can eat a longer lunch and stay on the bench
- You can stay inside and play different games
- You can talk to friends longer because we aren't playing

What I don't like:

- You'll land on the color red if you're bad
- Can't play games with your friends
- Can't play on the monkey bars
- You can't have fun without recess

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- You get to talk about what you've done
- You can explain why you got in trouble
- Avoid getting on red
- You won't get in trouble at home

What I don't like:

- Can't get candy
- Can't watch movies
- Can't eat popcorn
- Can't talk

Group #3

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- I don't get whoopings so I don't care
- I won't have to go to the office
- I won't get suspended

What I don't like:

- It will make me feel sad
- I will get locked in my room
- I might get smacked in the face
- You might get a whooping in front of your friends

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- It might be too hot or too cold outside
- It might rain and it would mess up my shoes
- I can play outside at home

What I don't like:

- I won't be able to play
- People will laugh at me
- You might get on a bad clip
- I might get my clip moved
- I might feel left out

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I won't get in trouble with my teacher
- I won't get in time-out
- You'll get to go to lunch
- The teacher might not call your parent
- You might feel better

What I don't like:

- I'd be mad

Class Vote for Second-Grade Deliberation Class #3

Before the Deliberation:

Call Home: 5

Take Away Recess: 1

Talk it Out: 15

After the Deliberation:

Call Home: 3

Take Away Recess: 0

Talk it Out: 18

Analysis

This first deliberation indicates that these second-grade students have the cognitive ability to discuss what they like and don't like about three different options. They tended to find it easier to discuss what they didn't like about a choice more than what they liked. About a quarter of their responses for why they liked a choice had to do with

what the child was doing to misbehave in class rather than what they liked about the choice as a response to the unwanted behavior. Examples they provided are being disrespectful, acting out, calling people names, or interrupting the teacher. The exception was the option of “talking it out.” For this option, the students didn’t talk about the unwanted behavior, but instead they described two primary categories for why this option was a good choice. A first category was lack of punishment. Many of the students liked that their parents wouldn’t find out or they wouldn’t miss their recess, or they might get a snack. Others thought their clip could be moved to a more positive place. The second category was relational. Students thought the teacher could help them, the student would listen better, the student could explain the behavior and apologize, the student would feel better, and the teacher could give good advice. I was struck by the difference in the students’ reflections of this choice, compared to the other two options. For the options of “calling home” or “missing recess”, students liked these choices because they would have time to think about what they did and learn a lesson, a parent could deal with the situation better than the teacher and, for some, missing recess and staying home wasn’t seen as a punishment. These responses weren’t as nuanced as the “talk it out” reflections.

Most students had similar reasons for why they didn’t like the option of calling home. Predictably, these reasons centered around punishment. Like the kindergarten and first-grade students, these students didn’t like the punishment they would receive; this was the most common reason for not liking the option. One form of punishment was physical in nature such as whoopings. Another form of punishment was not being able to play or having fun activities taken away. The students also didn’t like the emotional feelings of being embarrassed, scared, mad and sad.

Students expressed a range of reasons for not liking the second choice of “no recess.” Some talked about missing out on having fun or playing with friends or being left out. These were the relationship reasons for not liking this option. Students also talked about feeling angry if they missed recess, or the unfairness of the wrong person being punished, or this option being mean or hurtful. Only one group out of the three second-grade classes said that they would be more respectful or tell the teacher they were sorry if they missed recess.

There were a variety of reasons for not liking the option of “talking it out.” Consistent with the lower grades, many of these students were still afraid that their parents would find out or they would be punished in some other way. This was interesting because one of the reasons for liking this option was parents not finding out or the children still getting their recess. Consequently, there is some uncertainty about what the downside of talking to the teacher might look like in reality. Some of the students were also concerned that the teacher might get in trouble if too many of her students are on red, or that the teacher would be sad and embarrassed talking with the student. This was the only choice in which the students expressed concern for the adult in the situation. They didn’t talk about the downside of a call home involving a parent being sad, or disappointed or embarrassed by the child’s behavior.

Perhaps this is one reason why two of the three classes chose “talking it out” by a large majority over the other two options. In one class, 18 out of 23 students chose this option after the deliberation (first vote was 15) and 16 students in a second class chose talking it out (up from 3 from the first vote). Although these young students are still unable to fully express what they like and don’t like about the three options, this grade level appears to have a strong preference for talking it out.

Kindergarten Through Second-Grade Deliberation at Independence Magnet School

Number of Kindergarten Students: 23

Number of First-Grade Students: 18

Number of Second-Grade Students: 20

Unfortunately, there was only one flip chart per class instead of a flip chart for each small group and only one college student for the first-grade class. Consequently, the first-grade class had an entire class discussion of all three choices and the kindergarten and second-grade classes had three college students facilitating a small group discussion on only one option. After the students voted for their favorite choice, the children self-selected the option they wanted to discuss. Following their discussion of what they liked and didn’t like about the option, the children and the college student-leader told the rest of the class what they had discussed. A second vote was taken after the small group summaries.

Kindergarten Class

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- I’d be happy that my parents came to school
- I like punishments because I’ll know what not to do next time
- I’ll get out of time-out
- The teacher can call your parents for being good

What I don’t like:

- You will get a whooping
- No X-Box
- No candy (I like candy)
- I wouldn’t be able to go outside
- I’d get no food

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- I get to play with blocks

What I don’t like:

- Recess is fun

- I can get a whooping because my parents will find out that I got punished
- I can get in trouble because my parents will find out
- I'll have to go to the office
- I'll have to stand in line instead of playing
- I will feel angry
- You will get your tag moved
- I'll miss playing with my friends

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- You'll get a prize
- Get back to rainbow fish
- My behavior will get better
- I wouldn't get in trouble at home

What I don't like:

- I'd get a whooping
- I'd have to sit with another teacher
- I'd sit on a bench
- Can't play at P.E.
- Can't get a rainbow fish

NOTE: The students in this group assumed the teacher would tell their parents that they misbehaved

Class Vote for Kindergarten Class

Before the Deliberation:

Call Home: 6

Take Away Recess: 9

Talk it Out: 8

After the Deliberation:

Call Home: 8

Take Away Recess: 6

Talk it Out: 9

First-Grade Class

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- I'll do better in class because...
 - I'll get a whooping
 - I'll have to stay in my room
 - I can't play games
 - I'll get a time-out

What I don't like:

- You're not being respectful
- Disrupting the class
- You're talking when the teacher is talking
- I wouldn't have T.V.

NOTE: Overall, the students didn't comprehend and understand how to discuss what they didn't like about this choice

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- Listen
- Be respectful
- Call home

What I don't like:

- Hitting
- Not listening
- Not respectful

NOTE: The students didn't comprehend and understand how to discuss what they liked and what they didn't like about this choice

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I'll listen more because I'll know what the teacher wants
- I'll be respectful because I'll know what the teacher wants
- Don't talk back to the teacher
- I wouldn't get a whooping
- I'd still have time to play
- I'd learn a lesson
- I'd get to tell the truth

What I don't like:

- Can't go to stations because I would still be punished
- Got to be nice to the teacher but I don't want to be
- Your name would go on the clipboard
- A dojo point or star would be taken away
- You'd get after school detention

NOTE: The students in this group thought they would still be punished if they talked to the teacher.

Class Vote for First-Grade Class

Before the Deliberation:

Call Home: 7

Take Away Recess: 7

Talk it Out: 4

After the Deliberation:

Call Home: 3

Take Away Recess: 8

Talk it Out: 7

Second-Grade Class

Choice #1: Call Home

What I like:

- I'd get a time-out instead
- I would rather talk it out
- I could go home

What I don't like:

- I'll get punished
- I won't get to play videogames
- I'll have to stay after school for detention
- I won't get snacks
- I'll feel sad/mad

Choice #2: No Recess

What I like:

- It's hot outside so it's ok not to play
- I don't like to stand

What I don't like:

- It's better than calling home
- I'll miss my turn on the playground
- I can't play with friends
- I'd be sad and embarrassed
- I might get in trouble at home because my parents will find out I was punished

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I won't get in trouble
- We can settle it and I can do better next time
- You won't have to get a call home
- You'll be able to be honest and get your feelings out
- I won't get a spanking

What I don't like:

- You might be scared
- I'm shy
- Maybe it's something really bad
- The teacher will be mad at me
- I will feel embarrassed and angry
- I might not get any snacks or go anywhere when I get home

Class Vote for Second-Grade Class

Before the Deliberation:

Call Home: 4

Take Away Recess: 5

Talk it Out: 11

After the Deliberation:

Call Home: 2

Take Away Recess: 1

Talk it Out: 17

Analysis

As I look at the composite responses from the three classes across three grade-levels, I'm struck by the cognitive gaps between the younger students and the second-graders. The kindergarten students comprehended what they were asked to discuss and, overall, responded appropriately. There was only one instance when their answer didn't connect to the scenario of being disruptive; a student said s/he thought a call home was a good idea because the teacher can call your parents for being good. Consistent with the kindergarten students at Woodland Park, these students could identify what they didn't like about an option more than what they liked. Interestingly in the "what I don't like" conversation, all three options included responses that assumed parents would find out and punish the child. The children didn't say anything about not playing with their friends as a downside to "no recess" but they were concerned about being sent to the office or getting a whooping at home. The downside of "talking it out" ranged from getting a whooping at home, to getting punished at school, and even getting punished in the classroom. What they liked about this option included rewards and improved behavior but also included not getting in trouble at home.

The first-grade class seemed to struggle cognitively with the conversation the college students were leading. When the children gave an answer that didn't connect to the question under consideration, the facilitator attempted to explain the situation and ask the question differently. For example, when a child said "you're not being respectful" under the category, "what I don't like about calling home," the college student followed up by saying this is an example of something you are doing that might cause your teacher to call home. If she called home, tell me what you wouldn't like about your parents finding out? The lack of cognitive ability was most apparent in the discussion of the first two choices. For the third choice, "talk it out," the students comprehended and discussed what they liked about this option. Most of their responses related to learning and being a better student/person. Only one response focused on not getting a whooping at home and a second response on being able to play (have recess). When they discussed what they didn't like about the "talk it out" option, most students thought they would still be punished by the teacher, even if their parents never found out. They didn't think that talking to the teacher could involve not getting punished in some way.

The second-grade students easily talked about what they liked and disliked about each option, although they could name their dislikes more than their likes. Their dislikes are grouped into three categories. The first category is around punishment, mostly from parents (call home and no recess). The second category is relational; not playing with friends (no recess). The third category is emotional vulnerability (all three options). Interestingly, for the "what I like about the talk it out" option, three of the five responses were about not getting in trouble at home and two were about learning, expressing feelings, and doing better. But the consistent theme of what they didn't like about the option was the emotional vulnerability of being scared, feeling embarrassed and angry (both teacher and student) and being shy. These answers seem to indicate that the students aren't sure how a teacher will treat them during a conversation about the student's disruptive behavior.

Students in all three grades changed their votes after the deliberation with the second-grade class having the most vote changes. “Talk it out” got the most votes in every class/grade after the deliberation with all but three students choosing this option in the second-grade class. Two of the three classes/grades changed their favorite option from “take away recess” to “talk it out.” However, it is unclear how the deliberation affected the vote change, especially since many of the younger students had a difficult time deliberating each option.

Appendix D
Second Modified Deliberation Summary
January 16-19, 2018

Executive Summary

In January, 2018, thirteen kindergarten through second-grade classes at Woodland Park and Independence Magnet schools experienced their second modified deliberation, with a total of 223 children participating. The teachers had been experiencing too many students tattling on each other instead of trying to work out a situation before running to the teacher. We wanted to know how the children think about tattling as well as two other possible options in a common social situation. The teachers used puppets to role-play the following situation: Two puppets are fighting over a toy that they both want to play with. As they are tussling over the toy, one of the puppets grabs the toy and declares it is his/hers. The other puppet starts to cry. The teacher asked the children to imagine being in the sad puppet's situation and talk together about three possible ways they can act. The three choices are: 1. Find another friend to play with; 2. Tell the teacher; 3. Talk it out with the child who grabbed the toy.

The children were asked to secretly vote for their first choice before the deliberation. After their secret vote, the students were put into small groups and asked what they liked and didn't like about each choice. All small group facilitations were moderated by a college student. Each college student captured the children's answers on flip chart notes that I transcribed. After the deliberation, the children secretly voted again.

A detailed summary is provided in this document of the transcribed flip chart notes, the pre- and post-vote tallies, and my analysis of each grade level. The summaries that follow begin with the classes and grades at Woodland Park School, starting with kindergarten and ending with the second-grade classes. Each grade has its own document summarizing the results from that grade-level. The summary notes from Independence Magnet School follow my summaries of Woodland Park. However, because Independence has only one kindergarten, one first-grade, and one second-grade class, I have included and analyzed all three grade-levels in a single summary.

Having analyzed all thirteen classes, I am struck by the overall similarities across schools, grades, and classes. Interestingly, although the teachers are having difficulties with their students tattling on each other, the choice "tell the teacher" was the least voted for choice in both the pre- and post-votes with 38 out of 223 students voting for this before the deliberation and 44 out of 223 students after the deliberation. Although students could name reasons for liking this option (the most common themes were the reasons that warrant telling the teacher such as mean, hurtful and bullying behavior although themes also clustered around the teacher helping to correct the situation and the teacher punishing the friend who isn't sharing) they were also very clear about the downsides of tattling to the teacher. The most common responses related to the social consequences of telling the teacher. These included hurting or angering their friend, losing the friendship because they got their friend in trouble, possibly getting in trouble themselves, or being labeled as a snitch or a tattler. What struck me about the

students' responses to this option is the wide range of behavior that would warrant telling a teacher. With the scenario of tussling over the ball, students saw this behavior ranging from not sharing to bullying. Furthermore, only a few of the students saw their own part in creating the unwanted situation even though both friends were tussling over the ball. The teachers can build on this information by helping students understand differences in behavior (what does being mean look like and what are the differences between not sharing and being a bully?), when unwanted behavior should be worked out without the teacher, when the teacher should intervene, and, perhaps, most importantly, the role that both of the friends play in the unfolding situation.

As a composite group, the children also weren't all that keen on the option of finding someone else to play with. Forty-four students out of 223 voted for this in the pre-vote and 49 of the 223 students voted for this after the deliberation. A common theme across the grades was that they didn't want to find another friend because they liked their current friend and they didn't want to hurt their friend's feelings or make him/her sad by playing with someone else. There were some groups, however, that thought it was best to find another friend to play with who would share or be nice. Having said that, the children also realized that there was no guarantee that a new friend would share any better than their current friend.

The choice that, by far, received the most composite votes was talking it out. One hundred and forty-one children out of 223 voted for this choice before the deliberation and 130 voted for this choice after the deliberation. The reasons for liking this choice were very similar across all classes, grades and in both schools. Most of the children could see the relational benefits of talking. These benefits included being able to work out the problem, awareness that talking could strengthen their friendship, the opportunity to say sorry, and avoiding "messing up the friendship." Several groups also expressed talking it out as their preferred option when discussing the other two options. The students were also aware that talking it out has its disadvantages. Some students expressed fear, nervousness and shyness about talking with their friend. Others were afraid that their friend wouldn't want to talk with them or would be mean and hurtful. A few students thought that talking it out could even make the situation worse.

As I compare the first deliberation (they also preferred talking it out to the other two options) with this one, I am struck by the students increased awareness of the benefits of talking it out—they are describing very specific relational and interpersonal benefits. They also continue to have uncertainties and fears about talking it out. Teachers can continue to work with their students about ways to respectfully talk and listen to each other. They have the opportunity to continue to build on what the vast majority of students have said: Talking it out provides the best option for working through the problem while preserving the friendship and helping it to grow.

Woodland Park School Kindergarten Classes

Number of Kindergarten Students Represented in this Summary: 52
Three College Student Facilitators and one college student videographer

Class #1

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- It will make me feel better and feel happy
- It will teach them to not be mean to me and another friend will be nice
- They will share

What I don't like:

- Because I like my friend already
- They may feel sad if I get a new friend
- I don't want to be anyone else's friend. I already like the one I have.

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- I think you should tell so they will learn a lesson
- It will make them want to share

What I don't like:

- I don't want to be known as the bad guy
- It would make that person sad so I wouldn't want to tell on anyone
- People would think I'm a tattletale and wouldn't want to be friends with me

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- We will fix the problem if we do
- We will learn to be better friends
- We will share the next time that situation happens

What I don't like:

- I might be shy to talk about it
- I will feel sad

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- I would find other friends who would be a lot nicer
- Because I can play by myself
- Because they are being mean to me

What I don't like:

- I will play with someone else
- They might have another friend

- Because he is my best friend

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- They might tell on me first
- They might want to fight me
- The teacher might tell me to talk it out with my friend
- I'll be careful next time

What I don't like:

- My clip might get moved
- I want to be the nice friend so that I can talk it out with my friend

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Because we would get back together
- Because I don't want my clip moved
- So that we can be back as best friends, then we both can play with the toy
- They will leave me alone
- Because I like to play with them
- My friend won't tell the teacher
- If I talk it out, they will share

What I don't like:

- They are being really mean to me
- I'll just find someone else to play with
- I don't want to talk it out

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- The friend may want another friend anyway
- The friend might not be a good friend
- The friend might have more friends already and won't miss a friend
- If someone isn't nice
- If someone hits

What I don't like:

- It could hurt the friend's feelings
- Talk it out
- Would have to get to know someone new

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- I'd only tell the teacher if I was being hit
- The teacher might have a solution

What I don't like:

- The friend would cry if I told on him
- The clip would move to red

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- If you talk, you can get your friend back
- Tell the friend what you didn't like
- Ask the friend not to be mean again

What I don't like:

- The friend might not want to be friends anymore after their feelings are hurt
- Someone may not want to talk

Class Vote

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 3

Tell the teacher: 1

Talk it Out: 14

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 6

Tell the teacher: 2

Talk it Out: 10

Class #2

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Another friend will be much nicer
- Another friend will share with me
- Maybe it will teach my other friend a lesson on how to play with each other

What I don't like:

- Because I like the friend I already have
- My friend wouldn't like me to play with another friend
- It will make my friend sad if I find another friend to play with

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Because my friend is being mean to me and it will hurt my feelings
- They will learn their lesson

What I don't like:

- It's a bad thing to do
- It wouldn't be nice to do
- Because being a tattletale isn't right

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Talking it out will make us want to share
- Nobody's feelings will be hurt, and we will still be friends
- It will make me say I won't do it anymore and we wouldn't want to fight

What I don't like:

- Maybe you're scared to say the right things and they wouldn't listen
- Because they didn't want to share in the first place
- I wouldn't know what to say

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- I'd find another friend to play with so the teacher wouldn't have to know
- I'd find another friend to play with instead of fighting over a toy
- It's ok to find other friends to play with when there are disagreements

What I don't like:

- Don't want to hurt the friend's feelings
- Instead of finding another friend to play with, invite other friends to show how to be nice
- Show each other how to share

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- If they hit me I will tell the teacher
- Tell the teacher if someone is being mean
- If my friend is making fun of me
- Tell the teacher your friend isn't respecting you
- The teacher will put the friend in time-out if I tell her she isn't sharing

What I don't like:

- My friend will be sad
- I don't want to be a tattletale
- The argument will lead to fighting
- I wouldn't want someone to tell on me if I hit someone

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- You get to keep the friend
- Because you get back together with your friend
- It's the best choice
- I wouldn't have to find another friend

What I don't like:

- Maybe the friend doesn't want to talk
- I don't know my words that much
- Your teacher doesn't get mad about tattling

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- I would rather share
- I could find someone else to play with

What I don't like:

- Because she is my best friend
- I'd rather find another toy
- I wouldn't want to make my friend sad

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Because he's not my friend
- I don't want to find a new friend
- Because they are being mean
- Because they made me angry
- I'd rather say sorry

What I don't like:

- I'll find another
- I'll just find another friend
- Because they wouldn't be my friend anymore

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I'd rather talk it out because I don't want to find a new friend
- So I won't mess up my friendship
- We would still be friends

- Because I want to share
- It will make us both happy
- It will be easier
- Because I really want to play with my friend

What I don't like:

- Because he already made me mad
- Because I can get a different toy

Class Vote

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 2

Tell the teacher: 3

Talk it Out: 11

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 5

Tell the teacher: 6

Talk it Out: 5

Class #3

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Because they are being mean
- I want to help my friend
- They might start being nice

What I don't like:

- Because I love my friend
- I'll just get another ball

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Because they are not being nice
- Because the teacher will move their clip

What I don't like:

- My friend will be mad at me
- Because my friend will tell on me

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Because I want to be nice
- Because I can find another toy
- Because I want to play with my best friend
- If I talk it out, they won't tell the teacher

What I don't like:

- He won't be mean to me
- I'll just walk away

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- They will love to be respectful and play with me and not act like my other friend
- Another friend will know how to share better
- Another friend will be nice

What I don't like:

- I will feel sad that I have to play with another friend instead of my original one
- I might get angry
- It will make me mad

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Because they were bullying me
- When my friend is being mean it is the right thing to do
- So they will stop fighting

What I don't like:

- I feel I will get in trouble
- I will feel that I will be bullied if I told
- I don't want to be picked on and if I told that will happen

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- They will learn to be nice after we talk
- It will make us want to share with another
- We will be respectful towards each other

What I don't like:

- Maybe they will start being mean towards me
- We might not want to be friends anymore if we talk about it

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Because the new friend is mean

- If the new friend says you can't play with other people, find someone who is nice
- If a new friend is mean, stop being their friend and tell them are mean so they will start being nice

What I don't like:

- Instead of losing a friend, try to talk

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Tell the teacher because the student isn't nice
- If someone is being mean, tell an adult

What I don't like:

- Would have to keep finding new friends after the teacher punishes the students
- I wouldn't tell the teacher because nobody would like me anymore
- Nobody will play with me

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- The friends can still play together if they talk it out
- Can keep the friend forever
- Talking it out lets you have more than one friend because instead of finding a new friend you have multiple friends

What I don't like:

- I don't want to talk it out because they might say no
- The student might tell the teacher

Class Vote

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 4

Tell the teacher: 6

Talk it Out: 8

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 3

Tell the teacher: 5

Talk it Out: 10

Analysis of Kindergarten Classes

I have analyzed the responses across the three grades and many responses were similar. Regarding the first option of "finding another friend to play with," the student responses fell under two broad categories: reasons to not play with the friend; and, their own sense of agency. The most frequent responses included reasons to find another friend to play with. The children said it was good to find someone else to play with if their friend was hitting, not being nice, or being mean. Some students also liked this option because they thought if they played with someone else it would teach their friend a

lesson, the friend might want to share and the friend would start being nice. A few of the children also recognized that this option provided a sense of agency as it gave them a choice to find someone nice to play with or someone who would want to share.

When discussing what they didn't like, their responses fell into three broad categories: An empathic response; a friendship response, and emotional discomfort. The children expressed empathy for their friend by recognizing that if they found another friend to play with, their current friend would be sad, would cry, and would have his/her feelings hurt. One of the groups also said that the friend wouldn't want me to play with someone else. There were also responses around friendship. Some groups said they liked their current friend, they didn't want another friend, and the current friend is a best friend. They also expressed emotional discomfort with this choice. Some groups said they would feel sad and that it would be difficult to get to know someone new. Some also said that they would get angry or be mad.

This option received the fewest composite votes with only 9 pre-votes and 14 post-votes out of 52. None of the classes chose this as their first option.

The second option, "tell the teacher," included several reasons the students liked that stemmed from boundaries that had been crossed. Responses included being hit, being mean, bullying, making fun of me, not respecting me and not being picked on. One group liked this option because they were angry. There were also several responses clustered around the teacher being able to intervene. Some of the groups thought their friend would want to share if the teacher intervened. Others thought the teacher might have a solution, or encourage them to talk it out. One group was concerned the friend might want to fight and telling the teacher would help while another group thought the teacher could put the friend in a time-out so they wouldn't fight. At this age, the students seem unable to make the distinction between tussling over a toy and hitting, being picked on, or bullying. This may be one of the reasons the children go to the teacher when something has happened that may not warrant tattling.

The groups were able to name several reasons why they didn't like this option. Most of the responses clustered around their awareness of the social consequences of tattling on their friend. Responses included not wanting to be seen as a "bad guy" or seen as a tattler because others wouldn't want to be their friend. One group thought they might be bullied if they told on their friend. Some groups were concerned that their friend would be mad. A few of the groups were also concerned about what the teacher might do to them if they told on their friend. One group thought the tattler would get in trouble while another group thought their clip might be moved. A few groups were aware that their friend would be sad and cry if they told the teacher. There were also responses indicating the reasons not to tell. These responses included it's bad to tell, it isn't nice, and it's not right to tell. One group was also aware that they wouldn't want their friend to tell on them.

The overall votes for this option increased from the pre-vote to the post-vote. Ten children voted to "tell the teacher" before the deliberation and 13 children voted for this

choice after the deliberation. Two classes chose this as their second choice and one class ranked this choice last.

The children had the most to say about the third option, “talking it out.” Many of the responses for this option clustered around the theme of “agency.” The children felt that if they talk it out they will be able to fix the problem, learn to be better friends, share the next time the situation occurs, and keep the first friend while also having other friends because talking it out “doesn't mess up friendships”. Some groups thought talking it out would help them to be more respectful and to share. A few responses acknowledged the emotional upside of talking it out. These included reducing hurt feelings and making both friends happy. In addition to responses around agency, some of the groups thought talking it out would help avert unwanted consequences. Responses in this category included not getting their clip moved, the friend not telling the teacher, not needing to find another friend, and their friend leaving them alone.

There were also several things about this option that the students didn't like. Some groups were concerned about the discomfort of talking it out. They mentioned feeling sad and scared, being shy, and being unsure of what to say. Some groups were concerned about the possible social consequences of talking it out. They were afraid that their friend might not want to be friends anymore, that the friend's feelings might get hurt, the friend might not listen or might start being mean. One group thought the friend might say no to talking it out. The groups also provided reasons for not wanting to talk it out. These included if the friend is being mean or if the friend made them mad. One group said they didn't want to talk it out. There were two responses around agency. One group said that they could get another toy and another group said they could just walk away.

This option received a majority of votes for the first pre-vote with 33 of 52 students liking this option. After the deliberation, the vote went down to 25. Although the post-votes went down by 8, this choice was the clear favorite of the three options. Having said that, we don't know why the children changed their votes and what impact, if any, the deliberations had on their post deliberation vote. What we can say is that these children are able to provide a clear rationale for what they like and don't like about each option; they can name conflicting and competing outcomes that may occur based on what they do. The teachers can build on what their students are already able to describe as pros and cons of each of these options. Specially, the teachers can continue to help their students develop the language acquisition to name their thoughts and feelings about their social worlds and to listen respectfully to the thoughts and feelings of others.

Woodland Park First-Grade Classes

Number of Students Represented in this Summary: 63
Three College Student Facilitators and one college student videographer

Class #1

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Decide to share
- Decide to find someone else to play with because the other person is mean
- Since the friend was being mean, go play with someone else

What I don't like:

- Just ask for the toy back nicely
- Instead of finding another friend, talk it out
- Because it's my best friend, I don't want to find another friend

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- The teacher would fix the problem
- The teacher can tell the other person not to be mean so they can play
- Because my teacher is my best friend
- My teacher helps me

What I don't like:

- I wouldn't tell the teacher because I wouldn't want to get my friend in trouble

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- It's better to talk and fix the problems
- The teacher can help me and my friend be friends again
- Won't get in trouble
- Instead of being mad, talk it out

What I don't like:

- If one person is trying to talk it out but the other person is being mean, that makes me not want to do it

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Because if we play with another friend they won't get angry, they will share
- I would like it because it would be the right thing to do
- Because I would much rather play with my other best friend

What I don't like:

- Because we both want the teddy bear
- Because that's my best friend and I want to play with them
- Because I had the teddy bear first

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- She will help you in the situation
- She will fix the problem
- It's the right thing to do to tell the teacher

What I don't like:

- I don't want to get in trouble
- It will be tattletelling
- I wouldn't want to tell on my best friend

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- It's better to talk it out
- It will fix the problem
- Because it will make him happy
- It's a good thing to do

What I don't like:

- Because I grabbed it first
- I feel it wouldn't make it better
- Because he was being mean

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Because they don't want to play with me
- I would feel sad
- I will feel mad
- I will give them another toy

What I don't like:

- Because I love my friend
- Because he is my best friend
- I don't want to leave my friend

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Because I wouldn't want anyone to fight
- Because I wouldn't want anyone to get hurt
- I wouldn't want my clip moved

What I don't like:

- I don't want to tell on my best friend
- I wouldn't want my friend and I to get in trouble

- I'll just let my friend have it

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- So that we can share and play together
- I don't want my friend to be mad at me
- I don't want to get my friend in trouble

What I don't like:

- Because it's my favorite toy
- Because my friend isn't listening

Class Vote (Note: 1 child did not vote after the deliberation)

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 2

Tell the teacher: 1

Talk it Out: 12

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 0

Tell the teacher: 2

Talk it Out: 12

Class #2

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Another friend will love to share
- It would be much better. Another friend will actually want to play with you
- They won't hurt my feelings

What I don't like:

- They probably will be mean as well!
- They might not be nice like my other friend
- They might not want to play with you too

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Because they were being mean so I should tell my teacher
- She will fix it
- I don't like getting bullied and she will stop it

What I don't like:

- If I don't tell, they will actually play with me
- My friend will feel sad
- He won't be happy and will be mad at me
- They wouldn't bully me

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- We will make up and shake hands
- We'd be friends again and play together
- It will make them share next time
- We can fix it ourselves and wouldn't need help from the teacher

What I don't like:

- They might keep being mean
- He might bully me
- He might try to tell on me to the teacher
- He might hit you

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Get a new friend because friends should be nice

What I don't like:

- They don't want to leave their best friend
- They should learn to share
- My friend would be sad
- You would feel sad
- If the friend is sorry
- Learn to share
- They should talk about the problem

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Tell the teacher because people should be nice
- The teacher could help solve the problem between friends
- Instead of fighting the teacher could talk to the friends

What I don't like:

- Shouldn't tell the teacher because that is tattling
- So the friend wouldn't get in trouble
- The teacher would move the name clips
- People call tattletells snitches

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- We could be friends again
- The friend would say sorry
- You'd get to keep the friend
- You wouldn't get in trouble
- You wouldn't be upset about losing a friend
- Tell the friend what you like and don't like

What I don't like:

- The friends might fight
- Might not want to talk

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- She's too bossy
- I'll find someone else to play with

What I don't like:

- I would stay and talk it out
- Because they are being mean
- It would hurt their feelings
- Talk it out

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- She might not be my best friend anymore
- She might get punished

What I don't like:

- I don't want to make her sad
- Instead of telling, I would talk it out
- They won't be happy
- They will cry

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- You'll be happy
- They will be nice to me
- Because I wouldn't have to tell the teacher
- Maybe they will share with me
- They will be best friends again

What I don't like:

- Because they are being too mean
- I'll just take it
- Because they are bullying me

Class Vote

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 0

Tell the teacher: 3

Talk it Out: 13

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 1

Tell the teacher: 1

Talk it Out: 14

Class #3

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Just give the friend a toy and walk away
- Can get a better friend
- The friend might fight again so just get a new friend

What I don't like:

- Would play by myself
- Would hurt the friend's feelings
- If the friend is sorry
- Just learn to share

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- The two friends would still get into altercations, so the teacher could help
- If the friend is mean
- Only tell when friends are being affropride

What I don't like:

- So I wouldn't be called a snitch
- Other students threaten to be violent
- The teacher doesn't like tattling
- If someone is bad they don't want to get told on, they will be upset

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Both friends would be happy
- Friends wouldn't argue
- Friends wouldn't get in trouble

- Everyone would stay friends
- Nobody would get violent because nobody got in trouble
- If the friends talk they will always be friends

What I don't like:

- A friend might not want to talk about it
- A friend wouldn't want to fight instead, so there is no point in talking
- If the friend is mean, I still wouldn't want to talk

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- The new friend will be nice
- They will play better and won't hurt my feelings
- They will share

What I don't like:

- I wouldn't want to lose my friend
- Because my first friend is really nice and he just didn't mean to do it
- I think he might do me the same way as my other friend

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- When someone hits me I think it's good to tell on them
- She will tell him to say sorry
- I know she will tell us the right thing to do

What I don't like:

- I'm not a snitch
- I might get in trouble
- Someone might bully me if I tell

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- So we can have fun together and be back friends
- We both will apologize and say we're sorry
- So we can start back playing again

What I don't like:

- They might get mad at me
- They might don't want to talk about it
- Might start fussing at me and make me angry

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Because you're being mean
- He's being rude
- Because they are being a bully
- I don't want to get in trouble

What I don't like:

- He's my best friend
- I like them

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- I won't feel sad
- Because they are doing something wrong

What I don't like:

- I wouldn't tell on my friend
- I'd rather work it out
- You can get in trouble

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- So I won't get into a fight
- Talk it out so we can get better
- So we can stay friends
- Don't want to mess up my friendship
- It's always good to talk it out
- If you don't talk it out it will get worse

What I don't like:

- I don't like talking to my friend
- I hate talking it out
- Because they are bullying me
- They're being really mean

Class Vote

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 5

Tell the teacher: 1

Talk it Out: 10

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 3

Tell the teacher: 3

Talk it Out: 10

Class #4

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- They might just be mean to everyone so find a better friend
- Discuss with the person if they want to be a good friend
- Find a new friend because a friend is supposed to be nice

What I don't like:

- Just have to show the friend how to play correctly
- Talk to them and work it out instead of getting a new friend
- Don't stop being their friend, talk it out

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Ask the teacher to put the friends in different centers
- Tell the teacher about the new friend being mean
- Ask the teacher to show the new friend how to share
- Tell the teacher how you feel about the new student
- Ask the teacher to assign another student to walk the new student around the room and help them for the first day

What I don't like:

- The new friend is mean to everyone
- The person is just a mean person that the teacher can't help
- The teacher might be mean and the students wouldn't want to talk to her
- The new student's feelings will be hurt if a student tells on them because he/she is only acting mean because he/she is nervous and shy

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Instead of getting mad, just talk about sharing with each other
- Talk it out instead of losing a best friend
- Trying to understand your friend's problem
- The new friend can tell you how they feel and then you can tell them how you feel about being treated unfair

What I don't like:

- The problem keeps happening so talking isn't working
- Just find another friend to play with
- Don't want to talk about it

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Because I wouldn't have a mean friend anymore
- I wouldn't like to hang out with a bully
- Because my friend was being mean to me and my own friend is way nicer

What I don't like:

- Because it will hurt my friend's feelings
- They wouldn't want to be my friend anymore if I got a new friend
- I would feel my friend wouldn't like me anymore if I did so

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Because you're supposed to tell the teacher if they are being mean
- Asking the teacher if there is a way to settle this would be good
- The teacher will fix the problem

What I don't like:

- My friend will be mad at me and wouldn't like me anymore if I told the teacher
- I wouldn't want to tell the teacher because I want to be a nice friend

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- because my friend will not be mad at me so we can be friends again
- I wouldn't want to hurt his friends and we can still be friends
- Because we will stay friends with each other instead of not being friends anymore

What I don't like:

- Because my friend hurt my feelings
- He might be mean about it
- Might not want to be my friend anymore because I told her she was wrong

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- I would walk away and go to another friend
- I wouldn't want my friend to be mean to me
- I wouldn't want to be bothered

What I don't like:

- I would sing to my friend

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Because the teacher might punish them
- Because they were mean to me
- I wouldn't want to get anyone in trouble

What I don't like:

- I wouldn't want to be a tattletale
- They wouldn't be my friend anymore
- She might do it again

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I wouldn't want to disappoint my friend
- Because she is my best friend
- I don't want to make my friend mad and blow up

What I don't like:

- Because I might say bad words
- I'll just get another toy
- I wouldn't get a chance to play with the toy

Class Vote

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 1

Tell the teacher: 5

Talk it Out: 10

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 3

Tell the teacher: 7

Talk it Out: 6

Analysis of First-Grade Classes

After collating and analyzing the responses from all four classes, it is clear that, overall, these first-graders are able to discuss what they like and don't like about each of the options. The analysis of the pros and cons of the three options will be summarized across the four classes.

A sizable reason for "finding another friend to play with" clustered around emotions and feelings. Some of the students expressed that they would be mad or sad that their friend wasn't sharing; they liked the idea of finding someone else to play with because a new friend wouldn't hurt their feelings or wouldn't be mean. Several groups said they didn't want to play with a friend who was being mean to them. One group said they would rather play with another best friend while another group said they can find a better friend to play with. These responses were similar to a second theme of "anticipating a better outcome" if they found another friend to play with. Three different groups said they liked this option because other friends will share. Some students thought another

friend will be nice and that another friend would want to play with them. There were also students who expressed “agency” in what they might do besides finding another friend to play with. Two groups said that the friends should decide to share while other students said that they could just walk away from the argument. Some groups said the friends should just talk it out.

Interestingly, there were several groups that didn’t like this option because they thought there were other alternatives to finding someone else to play with. Several groups said the friends could “talk it out” and “learn to share.” One group said they could ask nicely for the toy. Several groups also realized the problem of sharing might occur with other friends as well. Four different groups said that the new friend might not be nice either while another group thought that the new friend “might not want to play with you.” The children also expressed reasons for not liking this option that clustered around empathy. Some groups said that finding someone else to play with might hurt their friend’s feelings or their friend would be sad. One group said, “I would be sad to find someone else to play with.” Perhaps this is one of the reasons for the most frequent response for not liking this option: Six groups said they didn’t want to find another friend to play with. One group said, “he’s my best friend” while other groups said they wouldn’t want to lose the friend. Lastly, there was a group that didn’t like this option because “I had the toy first.” This is the only response that indicated a sense of entitlement that the toy was his/hers rather than seeing the consequences (both good and bad) for seeking out another friend to play with.

For the second option of “telling the teacher,” the most common reasons for liking this option centered around the theme of “teacher as problem solver.” Several groups said the teacher will solve the problem for the friends or the teacher will help the friends. One group even had a solution that the teacher could implement of putting the friends in different Learning Centers. Some of the children also said the teacher will tell their friend to “say sorry” or “to not be mean.” Six groups said if the friend is mean this justifies the reason to tell. Some of the children also didn’t want the friends to fight or get hurt. Two groups cited personal reasons for telling the teacher: they didn’t want their clip moved and they didn’t want to feel sad.

This was also a reason for not liking this option. One group said they didn’t want their clip to get moved and four groups didn’t want to get in trouble. It appears that there is ambivalence around whether telling the teacher will keep them out of trouble or get them into trouble. Some of the groups clearly had a negative view around “tattling.” Three groups said they didn’t want to “be a snitch” and two groups didn’t want to tatttle. However, by far, the most frequent reason for not liking this option was relational and based on empathy. Six groups didn’t want to get their friend in trouble, six groups didn’t want their friend to be sad or hurt and one group thought their friend would cry. Two groups didn’t want to tell the teacher because their friend would be mad and another group thought their peers might become violent. Some students thought their friend would play with them if they didn’t tell the teacher. Students also expressed alternatives to telling the teacher that indicate their own sense of agency. Some student said to let the friend have the toy, while others said they would prefer to work out the problem themselves or talk it out.

This leads to the third option “talking it out.” There were several reasons the students liked this option that I’m labeling “positive agency.” Students said talking it out will fix the problem and keep the friendship. Groups also said it’s better to talk, it’s a good thing to do, we will make up, we can fix it ourselves, we can tell each other how we both feel, we can both say sorry and we can get better. There were also reasons centered around averting negative consequences. Some groups said talking it out won’t make the situation worse, it will keep people from becoming violent because they won’t get in trouble, the friends won’t get in a fight and they won’t get in trouble. There were emotional reasons as well. Some groups said both friends will be happy and they didn’t want to make their friend mad. A few students thought talking it out would lead to positive outcomes in the future. One group said it will make them share next time and another group said they will be nice next time.

There was a clear reason for not liking this option. Five groups didn’t want to talk if “the person is mean.” Interestingly, some students didn’t like this option because “I grabbed the toy first and it was my favorite toy.” In this instance the students see the fighting behavior as their friend’s fault instead of a situation that both friends are creating together. Additionally, some of the groups thought talking it out might make the situation worse. Three groups thought their friend might bully him/her, he might hit, tell on me, or get mad. One group thought “I might get mad” and another group thought “I might say bad words.” Lastly, two groups don’t like talking and three groups thought their friend wouldn’t want to talk it out with them.

Having said that, the favorite choice by far in both the pre- and post-votes for three out of the four classes is “talking it out.” Overall, of the 63 first-graders who participated in this deliberation, 45 students voted for this option before the deliberation and 42 voted for this as their first option after the deliberation. Eight students voted for choice one, “find another friend to play with,” as their first choice before the deliberation and 7 voted for this as their number one choice after the deliberation. Ten students liked “telling the teacher” as their first choice before the deliberation and 13 chose this as their first choice after the deliberation. The teachers can continue to build on this information by helping their students understand that they all play a part in what happens between friends and how they can express their needs and hear the needs of others in ways that strengthen their friendships.

Woodland Park Second-Grade Classes

Number of Students Represented in this Summary: 49
Three College Student Facilitators and one college student videographer

Class #1

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with
What I like:

- Because he's being annoying
- Because he is being mean
- He has bad breath
- They are bullying me
- You're being petty

What I don't like:

- Because she is my best friend
- It's my only friend

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- They might do it again
- He might tell on me too
- He broke the toy
- I would tell so she can get punished

What I don't like:

- I don't want to snitch
- I'd rather talk it out

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Because they won't do it again
- I don't want to mess up my friendship
- Because we can talk it out and share
- Because I like my friend
- Because my friend is funny

What I don't like:

- Because he's mean
- Because he has his own toys
- I don't want to share

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Because he's not being respectful and showing kindness so I know of other friends who will
- I know she wouldn't fuss over a toy like my other friend
- Because he will be nice to me

What I don't like:

- Because I know she will always have my back but we just got in an argument and she didn't mean it
- Because another friend might not be as nice as him
- Maybe she would say sorry before I go to another friend

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Because she will work it out
- It's fun to do so and they will now not do it anymore
- He wouldn't share and she would talk to us about it
- He was being mean and deserved to be told on

What I don't like:

- I feel like that's the wrong thing to do to my friend
- Maybe he will get sent home and I will have on one to play with
- We both may get suspended

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- We wouldn't want to fight each other anymore
- I don't want to lose my best friend
- We would learn to share more instead of fighting over it

What I don't like:

- I just don't feel like it because I know it will make matters worse
- Because she was mean the first time
- It will make me cry

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Want to be comfortable in a friendship
- If the friend is being mean, then find a new friend
- If the friend isn't sharing, find a new friend
- Friends should respect each other
- If the friend doesn't want to play anymore then find a new friend
- Doesn't like to share

What I don't like:

- If the friend said sorry, then he/she would be forgiven
- The friend may have more things in common and is a good friend. He just needs to learn to be nice
- Feeling would be hurt

- The friend would tell the teacher that nobody wants to play

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- I would tell the teacher what happened with my friend to be honest
- If someone tells on me than I will tell on them
- If a student is being mean
- The teacher needs to know if the student is being mean and not sharing

What I don't like:

- I don't like tattling on people
- Teachers don't need to know secrets
- Might not have been something important but the student told the teacher anyway
- If someone gets told on it hurts people's feelings
- The teacher doesn't like tattle tells

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Gets to keep the new friend
- Ask how the other person feels
- If the friend apologizes, they can stay friends
- If the person is sorry, they can talk about it
- If the friend makes you sad and they "talk it out" then I won't tell

What I don't like:

- If feelings are hurt, then people don't want to talk
- I wouldn't accept the apology
- If the friend isn't a good friend, than there is no reason to talk it out

Class Vote

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 3

Tell the teacher: 1

Talk it Out: 13

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 2

Tell the teacher: 3

Talk it Out: 14

Class #2

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Another friend will let me play with his toys and share

- The new friend will be nice
- So I won't have to have an argument

What I don't like:

- Because I already like my friend and I don't want a new one
- I want to stay friends with my old friend. He may not treat me the same as him
- I think another friend wouldn't want to share a toy either

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- She will move his clip
- She will tell him what to do and maybe take his recess away
- I know she will tell us the right thing to do and make us share

What I don't like:

- Next time my friend might be mad at me and say mean stuff I tell
- If I tattle tell to the teacher, the next time I do something bad they will bring it back up and think of ways to tell on me
- We both might get in trouble
- They might be mad at me

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- We might solve whatever is wrong
- It will make me feel good/better
- It will help my friendship and make us play better next time
- So they will never have to argue

What I don't like:

- If I talk it out, it might ruin our friendship
- I just know they still will be mean and do it again

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Because they are being mean
- They aren't playing nice
- They aren't sharing or playing fair

What I don't like:

- They might not let me play with their toy either
- Because they are my best friend

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- They might want to fight me
- They might tell before you do

What I don't like:

- You might get in trouble
- They might tell you they are sorry
- They make you sad and cry
- They might talk about you
- Might tell their mom
- They might not want to be your friend anymore
- They'll hit you

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- She might change her mind and want to share
- We might become better friends
- Because they are my best friend
- They might break your toy
- They won't tell the teacher
- They will play together

What I don't like:

- I'll get another toy
- Play with another friend
- I might get hit

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Friends are nice to each other
- Friends should share
- A good friend shares
- A good friend is nice

What I don't like:

- Sometimes a friend is nice and sometimes a friend isn't nice but we will always be friends
- Just because they are mean to you doesn't mean that you have to be mean to them
- Instead of getting a new friend I would talk about the problem with my friend
- Everyone doesn't have a good friend
- If the friend apologizes and is really sorry than they are their friend

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- If the friend was being mean and hurt someone's feelings
- If the friend isn't nice
- If the friend doesn't want to share

What I don't like:

- Maybe the friend was having a bad day and shouldn't get in trouble
- The friend will be sad and mad
- The friends will call people names
- Feelings will be hurt
- The friend might get violent
- Only tattle if someone is hurting you is what the teacher says

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Maybe the friend is sad and I want to make them feel better
- If I was the one being mean, I would apologize
- To keep my friends
- The friend could be sorry
- The friends can keep playing with each other and be happy

What I don't like:

- The friend might not be sorry
- They might not want to talk anymore
- Why talk to someone who made you feel bad?
- The friend might continue to be mean
- They will threaten to get new friends so I wouldn't want to be a friend again

Class Vote

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 6

Tell the teacher: 1

Talk it Out: 10

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 4

Tell the teacher: 2

Talk it Out: 11

Class #3

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- I can just talk it out
- Tell the teacher
- I wouldn't want to find another friend

- Because that person is being mean to me

What I don't like:

- Because she is my best friend
- I wouldn't want to play with the toy anymore
- I'll just play with someone else
- I'll just get another toy

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Because I wouldn't want to fight about it
- Because they're being mean
- The teacher would make them move their clip down

What I don't like:

- I don't want to tell on my friend
- I wouldn't have anyone else to play with
- We both might get in trouble

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- I wouldn't want to get me or my friend in trouble
- They might change their mind
- Because he's my best friend
- You can share it
- I wouldn't have anyone else to talk to
- Because I won't get in trouble by the teacher
- If I don't talk it out, he might not be my friend anymore

What I don't like:

- I'll find another friend and toy
- They aren't easy to talk to

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Another friend will be nice
- They will treat me better
- Because they are not rude like my other friend

What I don't like:

- I want to stay friends and not get a new one
- I wouldn't want to leave my other friend and make him feel bad

- Because I like my friend already and don't want to start making new friends

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- So I won't get in trouble. I will tell before we both do
- The teacher will work it out
- So she won't move my clip
- I will tell so he will stop

What I don't like:

- So I won't get my friend in trouble
- So we won't lose our recess
- Because that was my only friend and she wouldn't want to be my friend anymore
- My friend will be mad at me because the teacher will move him down to yellow on the clips

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- So we will be best friends again
- He will be happy and he won't be mad
- You will learn to share better

What I don't like:

- He might be still mad at me and it will make matters worse
- I will be scared to talk about it
- Shy
- Because if I were to talk it out he may say no I don't want to be your friend anymore
- nervous

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- You can meet new people
- Get a new friend if the friend is mean
- If someone is a bully they aren't a good friend
- When friends fight they aren't friends
- If a friend doesn't think about your feelings find another friend

What I don't like:

- It would make the friend sad
- Everyone is mean but a good friend

- Invite another friend to play with the group and show each other how to play correctly
- If you lose that friend you won't have any other friends

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Tell the teacher if someone hits you
- Tell the teacher if the friend is a bully
- The teacher could solve the problem

What I don't like:

- The teacher will be mad and say work it out
- It might hurt the friend's feelings
- You might lose a friend

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- So a fight won't start
- Tell someone what bothers you so they can stop
- Talk about why being bullied upset him

What I don't like:

- The person may not want to talk
- Someone may get upset with what they hear and get violent
- Maybe the two friends already tried to talk it out and it didn't work

Class Vote (Note: 1 student did not vote before the deliberation)

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 6

Tell the teacher: 1

Talk it Out: 7

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 5

Tell the teacher: 2

Talk it Out: 8

Analysis of Second-Grade Classes

In analyzing the three second grade classes, I am struck by their cognitive ability to describe what they like and don't like about the three options.

When discussing what they like about the first option, "finding another friend to play with," there are three overarching categories. The most common responses occurred in the category of *naming the reasons* for seeking out another friend. The most common response was the current friend was being mean. Groups also discussed their friend not being respectful, not sharing, not showing kindness, not playing fair, not sharing, being petty, and disregarding the feelings of others. What the groups didn't acknowledge was the part that both friends played in creating the conflict over the toy. A second category clustered around the theme of *anticipating better treatment* from another friend.

Students thought another friend wouldn't be rude or fuss over the toy. They also thought another friend would be more kind, respectful and nice. One group thought another friend would treat them better. These responses reinforce a third category that I'm naming as the students' *beliefs about friendship*. Groups thought that it was good to find someone else to play with because they want to be comfortable in their friendships, and that their friends should respect each other, share and be nice. One group said that "bullies aren't friends" and "friends who fight aren't friends." These are two examples of the student's inability to make finer distinctions about the possibility of two friends fighting over a toy who can still be friends or who aren't necessarily being a bully. Making finer distinctions, however, show up in later reasons for liking or not liking other options.

The primary reason for not liking this option is their value placed on the friendship. Several groups said they didn't want to find another friend to play with because he/she is my best friend or a good friend. Three groups said they like their friend and don't want a new one and two groups said he/she is my only friend. Groups were also aware that finding another friend doesn't guarantee the situation will be better. Two groups said another friend might not be as nice while another group said another friend wouldn't want to share the toy either. The students were also aware of the hurt feelings that playing with another friend might cause. Students said that their friend's feelings might be hurt, they might be sad or feel bad or cry. Four groups also recognized that their friend might "say sorry" and one group acknowledged that "friendships have ups and downs." Several groups were aware of the possible individual problems that might occur by finding someone else to play with. Students said that their friend might hit them, tell the teacher, talk bad about them, tell their mom or might not want to be their friend anymore. This age group seems aware of the retaliations that can occur within friendships based on how friends treat each other. A last category of reasons about this option that the students don't like centered on alternative and more appealing ways to act. Students talked about talking it out, getting another toy, and even inviting someone else to play with the friends to show how to play with each other correctly.

Regarding the second option of "telling the teacher," the most common reason for liking this option centers on what the friend did to warrant teacher involvement. Four groups said their friend was being mean, three groups said he/she wasn't sharing and two groups thought the friend might do it again and they didn't want that to happen. Students also said he broke the toy, he hurt someone's feelings, he isn't nice, and he is a bully. The range of these responses indicate the children aren't yet making finer distinctions between not sharing and being a bully. There were also several responses around *teacher as helper*. Students liked telling the teacher because she will make us share, she will tell him what to do, she will talk with us and help us solve the problem. Two groups said "she will work it out." Some groups also see the *teacher as punisher*. These students liked this option because the teacher will take his recess away or move his clip. The last set of responses clustered around the *desire to act first*. Two groups were aware that "he might tell on me too" and one group added to this concern by saying that "he might tell on me too so I'll tell on him." Another group liked the option of telling the teacher "so I won't get in trouble." Students at this age are aware that if they

tell the teacher first, they get to frame what the problem is and possibly absolve themselves of wrong doing.

Having said that, one of the most cited reasons for not liking this choice is the negative consequences for both of the friends. Four groups were concerned that they might get suspended or get in trouble and one group was afraid they would lose their recess. Two groups thought if their friend was sent home they wouldn't have anyone to play with. Two groups also didn't want to "be a snitch." Some of the students were anticipating the teacher's response. One group said the teacher doesn't like tattling while another group said the teacher would be mad and tell them to work it out. The students also expressed a *relational sensitivity* about telling the teacher. They didn't like this option because it's the wrong thing to do to a friend, it would hurt their friend's feelings, and the friend would be sad or mad. One group said they didn't want to get their friend in trouble. Another group was able to take the perspective and imagine that "maybe the friend was having a bad day." Lastly, students didn't like this option because they could anticipate their friend's response. Student said the friend might retaliate and "tell on me the next time." The friend might also be mad at me, make you sad and cry, talk about you, tell their mom, hit you, or call you names. Three groups thought the friend wouldn't want to be your friend anymore. These students are able to clearly talk about what happens when friends do something that is perceived as a betrayal to another person or to the friendship.

The option that the students seemed to like the best was "talking it out." The most common response for liking this option was not wanting to "mess up their friendship" (five groups said this). Two groups said we can stay friends and they are my best friend. One group said, "I like my friend." Students also talked about the relational benefits of talking it out. They said, it will help us play better, we can solve the problem, we can share, it will help our friendship, it will help us become better friends, and it can keep us playing and being happy. There were also responses that included taking the perspective of others. One group said, "the other person can learn how I feel," another group said, "we can learn how the other person feels," and a third group said, "if I was being mean, I'd apologize." Two groups thought that talking it out would change their friend's behavior. One group said they won't break your toy while a second group said they won't do it again. Others saw talking it out as a way to reduce negative consequences. Some students thought that we won't get in trouble by the teacher while other students thought that if we talk it out "I won't tell" or "they won't tell." A last cluster of responses were based on empathy. Responses included "maybe the friend is sad—I want them to feel better" and "the friend could be sorry." One group thought he would be happy if we talked it out and he won't be mad.

There were also reasons to not like this option. The most common concern was the fear that talking it out will "make matters worse" (four groups said this). One group said, "maybe they tried to talk and it didn't work" while another group acknowledged "if feelings are hurt we won't want to talk." Students also don't want to talk to a friend they perceive to be mean. Three groups said he/she is mean and one group thought the friend might continue to be mean. One group said, "if the friend isn't a good friend, there's no reason to talk." Another group said, "why talk to someone who made you feel

bad.” There were also fears that “I might get hit” and my friend “might not be sorry.” One group thought if we talked, my “friend might not want to be my friend anymore.” Students were also scared, nervous, and shy to talk it out. One group said “it will make me cry.” Two groups said they wouldn’t talk it out but rather they would play with another friend or get another toy.

Although talking it out received the most pre- and post-votes, the students are still aware of the negative consequences that can occur when they attempt to work out a difficult situation with a friend. The teachers can continue to work with their students to help them experience ways of talking with each other that help the children feel heard, respected, and that strengthen their friendships.

Independence Magnet School

Number of Kindergarten Students: 23

Number of First-Grade Students: 18

Number of Second-Grade Students: 18

Three College Student Facilitators and one College Student videographer

Kindergarten Class

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Another friend will share with you
- They will play with me
- Another friend will be nice to me
- I know another friend will treat me right

What I don’t like:

- It will make my friend sad if I find another friend
- I want to play with the friend I already have

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- I tell her when someone is not being nice
- When someone is not being respectful I tell the teacher
- When someone takes something I tell when they do and are being mean and grab my stuff

What I don’t like:

- I wouldn’t want to hurt my friend

- My friend wouldn't like it if I did that to him

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- We will be friends again
- If we talk it out we wouldn't want to fight
- You will learn a lesson and gonna share

What I don't like:

- Maybe we won't want to talk it out
- I know they wouldn't mean it and they will just be lying

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Friends shouldn't make you sad
- Friends are supposed to share

What I don't like:

- I don't want to make the friend sad
- The friends should stay friends and play together
- I love this friend
- They should talk about it
- If the friend says sorry
- To play with them you have to stay friends
- Shouldn't stop being friends just because of one bad day

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- If the friends don't share
- Tell the teacher if friends fight

What I don't like:

- I don't want the friend to get in trouble
- I don't want to hurt the friend's feelings
- Don't want to be called a tattletale
- I love my friend
- The friends won't want to be friends anymore

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Your friend will say sorry
- You can stay friends
- We can share together
- Don't want to fight

- We can be happy and play together

What I don't like:

- Maybe the friend will be upset about being wrong
- Scared to lose the friend if they think I am wrong

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Find another friend to make you happy
- Stay her friend forever
- Because she likes her friend

What I don't like:

- Talk it out
- Don't tattletale
- Just find someone else
- I'll find a nice toy
- Take turns
- We should just share

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- I'll tell because she should share
- Because they are bullying
- The other person will get in trouble

What I don't like:

- You might get in trouble
- It's not nice to tattletale
- You should act with kindness
- I will ask nicely
- You might not be friends
- Might take my tiger toy

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- So they can stay friends till the end
- Because it's nice to do
- If I talk it out, we won't fight
- I'll get to keep my snack
- My friend won't tell the teacher

What I don't like:

- Then my friend won't tell the teacher
- I don't like to talk
- I don't want to argue
- They won't be your friend

Class Vote

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 4

Tell the teacher: 8

Talk it Out: 10

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 11

Tell the teacher: 1

Talk it Out: 10

First-Grade Class

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- I'll talk it out
- I'll find another friend

What I don't like:

- I'll just play by myself
- Because they are my best friend
- We can just solve it
- I'll find someone else
- I like my friend

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Because they're being mean

What I don't like:

- The teacher would say I'm a tattler
- It would hurt my friend's feelings
- I'll just get another toy
- They might get in trouble and they'll be sad
- My teacher will be mad at us

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- It's nice to talk it out
- It might fix the problem

- It won't mess up my friendship
- Because she's my best friend
- I might not get in trouble

What I don't like:

- They might want to fight me
- I'll just get another toy
- I'll be too scared to
- We won't be friends anymore

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Another friend will play and want to play with me
- Because another friend will be nice and not mean
- We will have fun together instead of with my other friend

What I don't like:

- It will make my other friend feel sad if I did
- They might don't want to share as well

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- I only tell the teacher if they are mean or if they hit me or hurt my feelings
- The teacher will tell them not to do it anymore
- She will tell them what is right

What I don't like:

- Because I don't want to get them in trouble
- Maybe they will start crying
- He might get angry

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- We will make it better
- She will stop crying and being mad at me and want to be friends
- He will learn to share next time

What I don't like:

- It probably will make us don't want to be friends
- They might don't want to listen to me
- Because it might make her mad

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- I want my friends to be nice
- Friends should share
- Friends are supposed to respect each other

What I don't like:

- I don't want to lose a good friend over one mistake
- Because the friend is special to me
- Would still be friends

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- If someone is threatening you
- When your friend doesn't share
- When friends aren't nice
- The teacher can solve the problem better

What I don't like:

- Getting up to tell the teacher without permission gets you in trouble
- If you tell the teacher on someone but you are a part of it, you might get in trouble too
- Talk about the problem
- A friend will be upset if they got in trouble and won't want to be friends anymore

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- The problem gets solved faster
- The friends can say sorry
- The friends can learn to share
- They stay friends

What I don't like:

- Don't want to lose a friend by saying something mean
- The friend still might not be nice after the talk
- Maybe the friend doesn't want to talk

Class Vote

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 2

Tell the teacher: 5

Talk it Out: 11

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 2

Tell the teacher: 4

Talk it Out: 12

Second-Grade Class

Group #1

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Doesn't want to get in trouble for fighting
- My friends should be nice
- Friends shouldn't try to get you in trouble
- I have other friends who are nice and share

What I don't like:

- Because she is my best friend
- I wouldn't want to leave my friend because friends fight sometimes

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- The teacher didn't give permission to play with the object
- My friend wouldn't share
- If the friend is mean
- If my friend is hurting me

What I don't like:

- Because I wouldn't want to be called a "snitch"
- Maybe we both would get in trouble
- Wouldn't want my friend to get in trouble at home
- Wouldn't want my friend to be grounded, then I wouldn't be able to play with them
- My friend's feelings would be hurt

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- We can learn to share
- We can stay friends
- Talk about what hurts my feelings so it can stop
- Talk about being kind and respectful
- We can talk about how we are both sorry

What I don't like:

- If someone is mean, I don't want to talk
- If you tell them something they don't want to hear, they will be upset

Group #2

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- Another friend will be a good friend
- I know another friend will take turns and share with me
- She will be kind

What I don't like:

- I think another friend will do the same thing
- I feel that they both will be mean
- It will make my friend mad and sad if I find another one

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- If they only touch me or punch me I will tell the teacher
- The teacher will tell us to say sorry to each other
- They will get in trouble and not want to do it anymore

What I don't like:

- It will make my friend cry
- They will be sad if I tattled
- They wouldn't want to be my friend anymore if I told on them

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- We will get back friends
- We can play together and then be back friends and learn our lesson
- So we can both say we are sorry
- I feel it's good to talk it out and learn to share

What I don't like:

- It will make us not be friends anymore and we will get back to fighting
- Cause maybe she don't want to listen
- It won't make it better

Group #3

Choice #1: Find another friend to play with

What I like:

- I want to stay with my best friends
- I just find another toy and say ha ha ha
- I can make another friend
- I'll get another try

What I don't like:

- Because they are being mean
- They're not being nice
- They don't want me to play with them
- They would be upset with me

Choice #2: Tell the teacher

What I like:

- Because it was wrong to do
- My friend won't bully me
- Me and my friend can talk it out
- They might fight you and call you names

What I don't like:

- So we both won't get in trouble
- My friends might call me a tattler
- Someone might pick on me and mess with me

Choice #3: Talk it Out

What I like:

- Because she is my best friend
- We can become best friends again
- That was my favorite friend
- You can say I'm sorry

What I don't like:

- I'll just tell the teacher
- They won't let me talk
- I don't like to talk

Class Vote

Before the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 4

Tell the teacher: 2

Talk it Out: 12

After the Deliberation:

Find another friend to play with: 4

Tell the teacher: 6

Talk it Out: 8

Analysis

In analyzing the three grades, I am struck by the similar responses for all three options across the three grades. When discussing the first option of "finding another friend to play with" the children in all three grades discussed what they thought a friend's behavior should look like: friends shouldn't make you sad (kindergarten), friends should be nice (first- and second-grade), friends should share and respect each other (first-grade), and friends should be kind (second-grade). This seemed to reinforce a

reason to seek out another friend to play with. One of the kindergarten groups said that another friend will be nice and share and play. Some of the second-grade groups talked about playing with other friends who are nice and kind. Interestingly, a second-grade group also liked this option because they could find another toy to play with and “say ha ha ha” to their friend. There was a bit of reprisal in this reason for liking this option.

Having said that, many of the groups in all three grades were aware of the relational consequences of finding someone else to play with. All three grades said it would make their friend sad. The kindergarten students said they shouldn’t stop being friends because of a fight while the first-grade students talked about liking their friend and not wanting to lose the friendship. The second-grade students said they would not want to leave their friend. The kindergarten students also mentioned alternatives to finding another friend to play with. They said the friends should talk it out, should take turns or find another toy to play with. The first-graders also mentioned alternatives; “we can solve it” and, we can “talk it out.” A last downside to this option was expressed by the first- and second-graders. Both classes thought that another friend would do the same thing or wouldn’t want to share. However, none of the classes recognized their own part in the tussle with their friend over the toy they both wanted.

The pre-and post-votes for this choice as a favorite option didn’t change in first- and second- grade classes but there was a large jump from the pre-vote to the post-vote for the kindergarten students from 4 to 11 votes. As a favorite option, the composite pre-vote scores for all three grades was 10 out of 59 votes while the composite post-vote score was 17 out of 59 votes.

For choice two, “telling the teacher,” all three grades described the behavior of others that would warrant telling their teacher, and the reasons for telling the teacher varied considerably. The kindergarten students talked about others not being nice, not being respectful, grabbing toys and being mean, fighting, not sharing, and bullying. The first-grade students discussed telling on others who are being mean, hitting, hurting my feelings, threatening, not sharing and not being nice. The second-graders said they would tell when students are being mean, hurting me, touching me, punching me, bullying me, and fighting and calling me names. Additionally, the first-grade students liked this option because the teacher could help problem-solve by telling the friends what is right and to not do it anymore. The kindergarten and second-grade students thought that telling the teacher would help their friend learn a lesson. Both grades thought their friend would get in trouble and not want to do it again. One second-grade group saw the relational advantage of telling the teacher: “the teacher will tell us to say sorry.”

The most frequent reasons for not liking this choice centered around the relationship between the friends. All three grades talked about not wanting to hurt their friend’s feelings, making them cry, or getting them in trouble. One of the kindergarten groups said “you should act with kindness” (the A in SOARing behavior). Both kindergarten and first-grade students thought their friend might not want to be friends anymore if they tattled to the teacher. There were also personal concerns about telling the teacher:

All three grades didn't want to be labeled "a tattler" and all three grades were afraid that they would also get in trouble if they tattled.

The overall votes for this option decreased from the pre- to post-vote from 15 out of 59 votes to 11 out of 59. The vote changed from 8 to 1 vote in the kindergarten class while first-grade student votes decreased by 1 vote (from 5 to 4) as a first choice. The second-grade class increased their vote for this choice from 2 votes before the deliberation to 6 votes after the deliberation.

All three grades said similar things about what they liked about the third option, "talking it out." By far the most frequent responses were about the relational rewards. The kindergarten students talked about being able to stay friends, share, be happy and playing together, and not fighting. The first-grade students said talking it out would fix the problem, make things better, help them share, and keep them friends by not "messing up the friendship." The second-graders said they would learn to share, help change hurtful behavior, talk about being kind and respectful and having the chance to apologize. There were also individual rewards for this option. The kindergarten class said their friend won't tell the teacher and they can keep their snack while the first-graders said they might not get in trouble if they talked it out.

Having said that, there were some consistent concerns across the grades for not talking it out. One category of concerns clustered around various fears. One set of fears was the possibility of upsetting or losing a friend (all three grades). One of the second-grade groups was afraid that talking might make the friendship worse. There was also fear about the friend's possible response. A kindergarten group thought the friend might not want to talk with them. The first-graders thought the friend might become angry or want to fight. Some thought the friend wouldn't want to listen or wouldn't let him/her talk (first- and second-graders). A kindergarten group thought the friend wouldn't mean what they were saying and would lie. All three classes also identified personal reasons for not talking it out. These reasons included not wanting to talk to someone who is mean (second-grade) and not wanting/liking to talk (kindergarten and second-grade). These responses indicate that the children intuitively understand the benefits of talking it out but they are still afraid of some of the relational and personal consequences.

This choice received, by far, the highest composite vote as a first choice. The pre-vote was 34 out of 59 votes and the post deliberation vote was 30 out of 59. The first grade class increased their vote by one as a first choice while the kindergarten class decreased their vote by one and the second-grade class decreased their vote by 4. What we don't know about the voting for all three options is whether the children changed their vote as a result of the deliberation.

The teachers can build on what their students are already able to describe as pros and cons of each of these options. Specially, the teachers can continue to help their students develop the language acquisition to name their thoughts and feelings about their social worlds and to listen respectfully to the thoughts and feelings of others.

Appendix E
Third Modified Deliberation Summary
May 9-11, 2008

Executive Summary

The first two modified deliberations were based on real classroom issues the teachers thought would be helpful for the students to talk about. Both issues included three realistic actions that the teacher or the students could do based on the scenario that was presented. All kindergarten through second-grade students discussed what they liked and didn't like about each option.

For this deliberation, we wanted to see if the students could generate realistic options on their own and then discuss the benefits of each option. We also asked the students to decide which of the options they liked the best and why. The teachers decided on a fairly common scenario of putting students into pairs to work on a classroom assignment, although one of the students complains about being paired with someone s/he doesn't like. The scenario was acted out using puppets (one puppet says mean things about the puppet s/he is paired with). Following the role-play scenario, the teacher asked the students to imagine being in a similar situation and asked them to talk in small groups about how a situation like this can be handled. Each small group was facilitated by a college student and all of the children's responses were recorded on a flip chart. Following the small group discussion, each group presented their ideas and the teacher commented on the similarities and differences among the groups.

The entire summary of results for each grade, class, and small group are listed immediately following the Executive Summary. The remainder of the Executive Summary will describe the most preferred option for each grade level and the children's reasons for deciding on this option.

Kindergarten Classes

Of the four kindergarten classes and 12 small groups, half of the groups (six of twelve) thought the best way to handle the situation of someone saying mean things to them is to "talk to the student who is being mean". Their reasons for choosing this option as their favorite are the following (direct quotes from students):

- I don't want them to be mean to me
- They will learn to treat someone better
- We can talk together and figure it out
- Explain to them how to be nice
- The mean person needs to know how to be a good friend
- We will never be mad at each other and be friends again if we are working together
- I don't like to be treated that way so we should talk about it
- It will make him not be mean to others
- Being mean isn't nice

- Tell the bully to be helpful. If not, nobody will play with him
- Tell the bully to be respectful
- I will talk to him so he won't be mean to others

I grouped these responses into four broad categories. The most common reason for liking the option of “talking it out” is wanting to instruct the mean person to learn to treat others better (7 responses). This also included wanting to remind the mean person to be nice, be respectful, and be helpful. Two groups liked talking to the mean person because they want to be treated better and one group thought that talking it out would help preserve the friendship.

First-Grade Classes

There were five first-grade classes and 15 small groups facilitated by college students. Twelve of the 15 groups chose ‘talking to the mean person’ as their preferred choice.

Their reasons for choosing this option as their favorite are the following (direct quotes):

- It will make them apologize
- Tell the mean person to say sorry because you won't be friends with them anymore if you don't tell them
- They will maybe say sorry
- Maybe they will probably want to be my friend forever afterwards
- So I can have someone to play with
- The bully might be scared and lonely so talk it out
- Tell the mean person they aren't acting correctly in the classroom
- Because I don't want to be a tattler
- Ask them how it would feel if I was mean to them
- They will probably regret it and try to understand what you are saying
- They may feel bad and want to be friends with you and start over
- They say they are sorry and want to be friends
- I will ask them to stop being a bully and they will say I won't do it anymore
- If you don't talk it out, the next day you come to school they will still be mean
- If you talk it out with a grown-up they won't punish you
- If you talk it out with your sister, you will play well together
- You can tell them they are hurting people's feelings
- You can tell them that they won't have any friends if they continue to be mean
- If the bully apologizes then they can be friends
- So they can learn how to be a friend
- So they won't be mean anymore

I grouped these responses into six categories. The most frequent reason for liking this option is that it gave the students an opportunity to instruct the mean student on how and why it's important to be nice (6 responses). Five groups said that this option will provide an opportunity for the mean student to apologize. Four groups took the perspective of the mean person as their reason for talking it out. One group said that

perhaps the mean person was scared or lonely. Another group thought the mean person would be regretful and, consequently, they would listen if you talk it out. Similarly, another group thought the mean person may be feeling bad and would want to be friends and start over. Two groups wanted to talk it out because they wanted to remain friends or have someone to play with. There were three stand-alone reasons for liking this option the best. One group liked talking it out because they didn't want to be a tattletale. Another group thought the behavior would continue if they didn't talk about it and a third group didn't want to be punished so they thought talking about it would keep them from getting in trouble.

Second-Grade Classes

There were four second-grade classes with a total of 12 small group discussions. There was a tie for the most frequently liked option: four groups preferred "telling the mean person to stop his/her behavior" and four groups liked the option of "talking it out" (one group suggested another student should mediate the situation). Both of these options involved personal agency "through talk" to help change the situation. Interestingly, of all the grades, classes, and small groups in both schools, only one group in second-grade thought the best option was being mean back while another group in the same class decided the best option was being nice to the mean person even though they themselves weren't treated well.

Reasons for their preferred option of talking with the mean person (direct quotes):

- Maybe the person doesn't think they are being mean
- It makes people mad and sad
- So the person that is mean can understand better
- It makes people feel sad and not want to talk to you
- He will be nicer and just say sorry
- It will make them go back and not do it anymore
- I just might go find a better (nice) friend
- Because I don't like anyone picking on me
- They wouldn't like it if I picked on them
- Tell them you are sorry; give a compliment; solve the problem on your own
- Because I want him to be my friend
- Because I don't want to get in trouble and make things worse
- We can work it out
- Maybe the person who is being mean was being talked about
- Maybe the person who is being mean is jealous
- Talk to the bully and figure out the problem
- Maybe the bully doesn't know you, so ask to be nice and know each other
- Tell the bully how you feel
- Instead of fighting, talk about the problem

The reasons for liking the option of telling the person to stop being mean or talking it out fell under two broad categories (four reasons for each category): "Imagining reasons

for the mean behavior” (talking as the ability to do perspective taking) and “providing instruction in hopes of changing the unwanted behavior”. Responses involving perspective-taking included: maybe the person doesn’t think they are being mean; maybe the mean person was talked about, maybe the mean person is jealous; and, maybe the bully doesn’t know you so ask to be nice and know each other. Under the category of instruction, students said: so the person that is mean can understand better; being mean makes people feel sad and not want to talk to you; it will make them go back and not do it anymore; I just might go find a better (nice) friend if they continue to be mean.

Additionally, one group thought talking it out would help the mean student apologize and act nicer, another group thought talking it out would reduce being picked on, and a third group didn’t want to get in trouble and make things worse.

In summary, students were not given predetermined options to discuss but rather were asked to generate their own options, talk about what they like about the various options that they generated, and choose the option(s) they liked the best. Every grade level chose some form of talking with the mean student as their preferred way of handling what to do when someone says mean things. Although there were similar reasons across grade-levels for liking this option the best, the first- and second-grade students provided more nuanced responses which also included imagining what the mean person might be thinking and feeling.

Below is the full transcription of all the options generated along with the students’ reasons for liking each option. An asterisk is placed next to the option(s) that the students liked the best. The summary is categorized by school and grade-level.

The question that the children discussed based on the scenario of a puppet saying mean things to another puppet is, “What to do when someone says mean things?”

Independence School

*=favorite choice

Kindergarten

Group #1:

*I would tell my friend to please be nice to me. Reasons for liking this choice: I don’t want them to be mean to me.

I will tell the teacher, because they hurt my feelings. Reasons for liking this choice: It’s not right to hurt people; Don’t hit someone in the head

I would tell their parents so they will get in trouble. They could not provide a reason for liking this choice.

Group #2:

*I would ask them to be nice and not be mean. Reasons for liking this choice: It will make them not want to do it anymore; They will learn to treat someone better; We can talk together and figure it out.

Just apologize. Reasons for liking this choice: They will say they are sorry; We will be friends again.

Maybe tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: They will know to do better; Getting in trouble will make them not want to do it anymore.

Group #3:

*Tell the person who is being mean to say sorry and then be friends with each other. Reasons for liking this choice: The mean person needs to know how to be a good friend

*Talk to the person who is being mean and explain to them how to be nice because everyone should be nice to each other.

*Tell the teacher who is being mean and ask the teacher to make them apologize. Reasons for liking this choice: The teacher can help talk to the mean person about hurting people's feelings.

Tell the person that is being mean to play nice because everyone are friends. They didn't provide reasons for why they like this choice.

Maybe the person who is being mean doesn't have any friends so ask them to be your friend and the person will become nice. They didn't provide reasons for why they like this choice.

First-Grade

Group #1

*I will try to talk it out with my friend. Reasons for liking this choice: It will make them apologize.

I will tell on them. Reasons for liking this choice: Because they are being mean to me. I will ask them to stop talking about me.

I will tell the teacher on them. Reasons for liking this choice: I will want to talk about it.

I will talk about them back. Reasons for liking this choice: I will roast them; I will make fun of them; I'll punch them in the face.

I will back away from them. They didn't provide reasons for why they like this option.

Group #2

*Tell the mean student to say sorry to the person who got hurt feelings. Reasons for liking this choice: If you don't tell them you won't be friends with them anymore.

*Tell the teacher what happened if the mean student doesn't stop. Reasons for liking this choice: The teacher will punish them and hopefully they won't do it again.

*Ignore the mean student. Reasons for liking this choice: The student that is hurt won't get in trouble for yelling or hitting because of hurt feelings.

Don't play with the mean student to show them he has nobody to talk/play with because of the attitude. Reasons for liking this choice: The mean person will eventually stop once he figures out he doesn't have any friends.

Group #3

*I will try to talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: They will maybe say sorry; Maybe they will probably want to be my friend forever afterwards; So I can have someone to play with.

I will tell them that it is better to be nice. Reasons for liking this choice: It's better to be respectful; It will make us do fun things and be friends; Being nice is a good thing.

I will tell them that it's not OK or a good thing to be mean. Reasons for liking this choice: You being mean will make me sad and upset; Because it's not nice; Being mean will make others not like you.

Second-Grade

Group #1

*Tell the mean person to stop being mean. Reasons for liking this choice: Maybe the person doesn't think they are being mean; It makes people mad and sad.

*Get another student to mediate the conversation. Reasons for liking this choice: So the person that is mean can understand better.

*Tell the person they should want to be nice. Reasons for liking this choice: It makes people feel sad and not want to talk to you.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: The teacher will punish them or take them to the side and ask why they are being mean.

Tell them they are being mean. Reasons for liking this choice: Let them get their feelings hurt like they make other people feel

Group #2

*I will tell the teacher or my mom. Reasons for liking this choice: They might give me advice on how to deal with the mean person; They would leave me alone.

I will walk away from them. Reasons for liking this choice: I will just play with other friends; It will make me sad, mad and angry.

I would ask them to be nice. Reasons for liking this choice: I want them to still be my friend; I don't like when they are mean.

I will be mean back to them. Reasons for liking this choice: So they will know how it feels.

I will get another friend. Reasons for liking this choice: I can find a nice friend.

Group #3

*I will tell the classmate to stop saying mean things and to be nice. Reasons for liking this choice: He will be nicer and just say sorry; I might just go find a better (nice) friend; It will make them go back and not do it anymore.

Walk away and find someone else to play with. Reasons for liking this choice: It will make her sad and jealous; It will let her know that she hurt my feelings; They should not be a bully and it will show them to stop.

I will tell the teacher and not it anything. Reasons for liking this choice: The teacher will tell them to stop and learn how to play with someone; They will get punished for being a bully; It will make my day feel better.

Woodland Park School Kindergarten Classes

Class #1

Group #1

*Find another friend. Reasons for liking this choice: The old friend was a bully; Friends are not mean to each other; Make more friends to not rely on the old friend; Because the other friend was being mean and real friends are nice to each other and play with other people.

Talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: You aren't supposed to say mean things; I don't like it when you hurt my feelings; Ask the bully not to do it anymore; Tell the bully he won't have any friends; Maybe the bully is jealous so talk to them and figure out why.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: She will move their clip; She would talk to the bully and tell them to stop; They will get in trouble.

Group #2

*I will stop them for talking about me. Reasons for liking this choice: So they can stop being mean; It will hurt my feelings.

I will talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: Ask them not to talk about you; So we can remain friends; So they will play with you again.

I will tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: Their clip will get moved; The teacher will tell us to talk it out; They will get suspended; They won't be mean anymore.

I will play with a new friend. Reasons for liking this choice: Because I don't want to be friends with them anymore; I don't like being talked about.

Group #3

*I will talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: We will never be mad at each other and be friends again if we are working together; I don't like to be treated that way so we should talk about it; It will make him not be mean to others.

*I would tell them I don't like to be treated that way. Reasons for liking this choice: Because being mean is not nice; It will make me sad; Maybe I will cry.

I will tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: She will call his mom and send him to the office; I know my teacher will fix the problem; She will make us talk about it.

I will say can you stop and never do it again. Reasons for liking this choice: Because it's rude. Because it hurt my feelings; I don't like it.

Class #2

Group #1

*I will tell my mom. Reasons for liking this choice: I won't have to worry about it. So they won't do it again.

*I'll make up with them. Reasons for liking this choice: I want to be nice to them even though they aren't being nice to me.

I can tell my teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: Because they hurt my feelings.

I can play with a new friend and not play with them. They didn't provide reasons for why they like this option.

I will just not play with them. Reasons for liking this choice: They might hurt me. They might bully me.

I'll just hit them or bully them back. They didn't provide reasons for why they like this option.

Group #2

*Talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: Tell the bully to be helpful. If not, nobody will play with him; Tell the bully to stop being mean or he won't have friends; Tell the bully to be respectful.

Tell the bully to be nice. Reasons for liking this choice: He is making people sad and angry.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: She would say stop being mean; she would make us talk it out; she would make the bully say sorry.

Group #3

*Talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: So we can be friends; I will talk to them so they won't be mean anymore.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: She will fix things; The teacher will tell them to be nice; The teacher will put him in timeout; She will make things better.

Help them be nice. Reasons for liking this choice: To show others how to be respectful; Because it's not ok to hurt anyone's feelings; Because it's not ok what he is doing; It's not ok to be mean and say bad things.

Class #3

Group #1

*I will talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: Because we should work together and maybe they will listen; Maybe they will say they are sorry; So everything will become better and we can be friends.

I will just find another friend. Reasons for liking this choice: Because I think she is a bully and you shouldn't do that; So they won't continue to be mean to others.

I will tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: She will give them a referral and put them in the corner; She will tell us to just work it out; The teacher will ask what happened and she will try and fix it.

Try to figure out why he's being mean so that you can be friends. Reasons for liking this choice: So they will know what's right and say sorry; By thinking about it you would know what you did wrong.

Group #2

*I will try to talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: I will tell them to let's just be friends and shake it out; So I can keep my friend.

I will tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: Because they hurt my feelings.

I will tell my mom. Reasons for liking this choice: Because they will get punished.

I will find another friend. Reasons for liking this choice: Because they are being a bully.

I will make them stop. They could not provide a reason for liking this option.

I will teach them to be nice. Reasons for liking this choice: So that they can be nice to others.

Group #3

*Talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: Ask if the bully is ok since he is being mean; Ask the bully to say sorry; The bully won't have any friends if he stays mean; Tell the bully you will not share anything with them.

Walk away. Reasons for liking this choice: The bully will leave you alone; You will not hear any mean things if you walk away.

Tell an adult. Reasons for liking this choice: The teacher can give them a write-up; Teacher can help talk to both people to figure out the problem.

Woodland Park First-Grade Classes

Class #1

Group #1

*Work out the problem with the person who is being mean. Reasons for liking this choice: The bully might be scared and lonely so talk it out; Tell the mean person they aren't acting correctly in the classroom.

*Still be nice to the bully. Reasons for liking this choice: The person is being mean but you should still be nice; The bully will give up and eventually be nice; Show the bully if you can be his friend he will start to be nice and make more friends.

*Maybe the bully is being bullied. Reasons for liking this choice: Show the bully you aren't afraid and he or she will stop; Tell the bully he shouldn't make other people upset just because he is.

Tell the bully to be nice to friends. Reasons for liking this choice: The bully should be told how friends are treated; Ask the bully to be a friend to change their attitude; Tell the bully they will make friends if she or he stops being mean.

Show the bully people have feelings too. Reasons for liking this choice: Tell the bully to he makes people feel (sad, mad, crying). It might make the bully stop being mean knowing how people feel.

Group #2

*I will tell them to leave me alone. Reasons for liking this choice: Because I don't want to be a tattletale; Ask them how it would feel if I was mean to them.

I would just walk away and ignore them. The group didn't provide reasons for why they liked this option.

I will tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: They will be mad at their selves; If they don't stop, they might do more.

I will tell them to not be mean. Reasons for liking this choice: It might hurt my feelings.

I will stand up for myself. Reasons for liking this choice: Because I believe in myself; I wouldn't be friends with them anymore.

Group #3

*Talk about it with them. Reasons for liking this choice: They will probably regret it and try to understand what you are saying; They may feel bad and want to be friends with you and start over; They say they are sorry and want to be friends; I will ask them to stop being a bully and they will say I won't do it anymore.

You can just walk away (but I think they will keep following me and keep bullying me if I do). Reasons for liking this choice: You can just play with someone else until they calm down; They will know how it made you feel if you walk away from the situation.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: She will punish you by moving your clip and taking away recess; She will tell them to stop and say sorry; She will tell your mom and she will make you not be mean anymore.

Class #2

Group #1

*We can work it out. Reasons for liking this choice: They won't bully you anymore; They will stop being mean to you.

I should talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: It will stop them from being mean; We can still be friends; You will help them work out their anger.

I will tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: Because they are bullying; The teacher will fix the problem.

I will tell them I'm sorry. Reasons for liking this choice: Because I don't know what they are dealing with; They didn't mean to do it; Friends always stick together.

Group #2

*I will be nice so they will learn to be nice back. Reasons for liking this choice: It will teach them not to say mean things; They will learn it's not ok to bully.

Teach them how to treat others. Reasons for liking this choice: So they won't hurt your feelings; Because it's better to be respectful.

Talk it out with them. Reasons for liking this choice: So they won't be mean again; To solve the problem.

I will tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: She will tell them to not be mean and to be nice; It will teach them not to say bad things; They will learn it's not ok to bully.

Group #3

*Talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: If you don't talk it out, the next day you come to school they will still be mean; If you talk it out with a grown-up they won't punish you; if you talk it out with your sister you will play well together.

*Be nice to the other people. Reasons for liking this choice: If you are nice to other people they will be nice to you. If you respect other people they will be respectful to you; If you say mean things to someone they will say mean things to you.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: The person saying mean things will be put in time-out; The person saying mean things will go to the office or get written up.

You need to respect other people. If you see a big kid bullying a smaller kid you need to help the little kid.

Class #3

Group #1

*Talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: You can tell them they are hurting people's feelings; You can tell them that they won't have any friends if they continue to be mean; If the bully apologizes then they can be friends.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: She will move their clip; she will call the office; she can ask the bully why he is being mean.

Stand up to the bully. Reasons for liking this choice: Show you aren't scared so they will stop; walk away and ignore them.

Group #2

*Stand up for yourself. Reasons for liking this choice: Because I'm being a tough boy; It makes you look strong.

I should tell someone or a grown-up. Reasons for liking this choice: Because they are acting foolish; They are being ugly.

I will tell them I don't like that. Reasons for liking this choice: Because I don't want to get in trouble; They are being a bully.

I should play with another friend. Reasons for liking this choice: So they won't keep being mean; I won't have to tell the teacher; it's a way to ignore them.

I will just ignore them. Reasons for liking this choice: I don't want to hear them being mean to me.

I will walk away. Reasons for liking this choice: Because you don't want to hear that or play with them; they are acting stupid.

Group #3

*I will tell them you can just talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: So they can learn how to be a friend; So they won't be mean anymore.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: Because the teacher will do something about the situation; The people that are being mean will get in trouble; She will move your clip.

I will tell them to please stop being mean because it's not nice. Reasons for liking this choice: Maybe they would listen and not do it anymore; They will learn a lesson and will be nice to others; they will learn to act with kindness; they will be respectful to other people.

I will tell them that it is better to be friends with someone instead of being mean. Reasons for liking this choice: So they can treat other people better and nice; So they will work well with others.

Class #4

Group #1

*I will tell them to quit being a bully. Reasons for liking this choice: So they will know how to be respectful; You will know it's not ok to be a bully and say mean things; It's best to just be friends and be nice to others.

I will tell them to talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: Because maybe they will stop being mean; Because talking it out is the right and best thing to do; Because we can fix the problem ourselves instead of telling the teacher.

I will tell them to stop being mean and say sorry. Reasons for liking this choice: You are being a bully if you don't apologize; Because that way they will be nice and be taught how to be a friend; Because the other boy who is getting bullied may not like it.

It's good to just be kind to others. Reasons for liking this choice: So you will know how to be respectful; You will know that it's not ok to be a bully and say mean things; It's best to just be friends and nice to each other.

Group #2

*I'll be friends with someone else. Reasons for liking this choice: It can make you sad; It's not the right thing to do—I have feelings.

I will talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: That's the best thing to do before you tell the teacher; Tell them why it's good to be nice; They will still be your friend.

I will tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: Because that's what you should do; They won't bully you anymore.

I will be kind to them no matter what. Reasons for liking this choice: Because everyone has feelings.

I will tell them to stop. Reasons for liking this choice: It's not nice to bully others; So that we can remain friends.

Group #3

*Talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: You can say, stop being mean; Respect other people; You have to SOAR; You can ask the bully if someone was being mean to you who would you feel?; Try to solve the problem themselves before telling the teacher because they are smart enough to make friends; Ask the bully why he or she is being mean.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: The teacher can solve the problem. The teacher will say, talk it out; The bully will get a time-out; The bully will get his clip moved; If the bully will not stop then the teacher can make the bully be nice.

Find another friend. Reasons for liking this choice: Ignore the bully; Friends are supposed to be nice to each other; Find better people to play with; I don't want a friend who is mean to other people; The bully wouldn't be a bully anymore once he or she finds new friends.

Woodland Park Second-Grade Classes

Class #1

Group #1

*I would ask her to stop being mean. Reasons for liking this choice: Because I don't like anyone picking on me; They wouldn't like it if I was picking on them.

I would try to solve the problem by talking it out. Reasons for liking this choice: I can say sorry; Tell the person don't do it again because it hurt my feelings.

I will work it out by myself. Reasons for liking this choice: Because it might save the friendship; So they won't talk about me anymore.

I will find someone else. Reasons for liking this choice: Because they are hurting my feelings; They might continue to talk about me.

I would walk away. Reasons for liking this choice: I would walk away because they might keep doing it.

I would ignore them. Reasons for liking this choice: Because I don't believe them; Because I'm brave.

Group #2

*Talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: Tell them you are sorry; Give a compliment; Solve the problem on their own.

Be friends. Reasons for liking this choice: Give the person whose feelings were hurt a gift; Want to eat lunch with me?; Want to play?

Find another friend. Reasons for liking this choice: Good friends aren't mean to each other; After the person who is mean says sorry.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: So the students won't fight.

Walk away. Reasons for liking this choice: Leave the mean person alone to stop conflict.

Group #3

*Just not be their friend. Reasons for liking this choice: Because they were being mean and I didn't like it; I feel I wouldn't want to talk and be friends because they were trying to hurt my feelings; Because making fun of people is not a nice thing to do, so I wouldn't want to be friends with them.

You should be nice to others. Reasons for liking this choice: You should be nice because you should treat others the way you want to be treated; It's better to do the right thing.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: The teacher will make them say sorry; She will suspend them/take recess away/move their clip; The teacher will help them get along.

Work it out with classmates. Reasons for liking this choice: Either way it goes, we will come back tomorrow as friends; They won't be mean to you if we talk about it; if we learn in groups we will have a better relationship.

Class #2

Group #1

*Talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: Because I want him to be my friend; Because I don't want to get in trouble and make things worse; We can work it out.

Find another friend to play with/Walk away. Reasons for liking this choice: Because I don't want to be treated that way; Because he was being mean and you should be nice; I will feel sad though.

Say, “what did I ever do to make you mad/angry?” Reasons for liking this choice: Because I feel I didn’t do anything to deserve to be treated that way; I feel like that is being a bully to me.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: Because if you tell the teacher the whole thing will go away; She will make things better and she will handle it; The whole situation will be over with.

Group #2

*I will find another friend. Reasons for liking this choice: Because they are being mean and I don’t like that; He might not want to be my friend anymore; I will find a nice friend.

I would like to talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: What did I do to you?; I would ask him why he’s not being nice.

I will tell them I’m sorry. Reasons for liking this choice: He probably said sorry and I said it back; I would tell him sorry because he was bullied and now he’s being a bully.

I would talk to the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: I wouldn’t want to say bad things back; Because they made me feel sad; Because I don’t like bullies.

I will work it out with him. Reasons for liking this choice: So that he can calm down. He might have a bad temper; So that we can become friends again.

Group #3

*Ask what the person has done to be treated in such an unfair way. Reasons for liking this choice: Ask why they are being mean and what they can do to change it.

*They can resolve the problem themselves. Reasons for liking this choice: Maybe the person who is being mean was being talked about; We are friends and I wouldn’t talk about you; maybe the person who is being mean is jealous; Talk to them about being a sharing friend and they will stay friends so no need to be jealous.

*Tell the person who is being mean that they hurt someone’s feelings and ask them to apologize. This group didn’t provide reasons for why they like this option.

Find a new partner. Reasons for liking this choice: If the mean person sees their friend playing with someone else it will make him say sorry and get the friend back.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: The teacher can talk to the mean student and make them understand what was said was mean.

Class #3

Group #1

*Talk it out. Reasons for liking this choice: Talk to the bully and figure out the problem; Maybe the bully doesn't know you, so ask to be nice and know each other; It will make it easier to become friends; Tell the bully how you feel; Instead of fighting, talk about the problem.

Walk away. Reasons for liking this choice: It will stop an argument; The bully won't get upset and follow you or hit you.

Ask to become friends. Reasons for liking this choice: Still be nice to the bully and maybe he will start being nice to other people; Maybe it's because he is new and doesn't know anyone; Share with the bully and he will see there are nice people who could be his friend.

Show your feelings to the bully. Reasons for liking this choice: Explain how sad or upset you are; She the bully care even though he or she is being mean; Forgive the bully even though feelings are hurt.

Group #2

*If they are mean to me, I'll be mean to them. Reasons for liking this choice: I'll hurt your feelings.

I will go to another group. Reasons for liking this choice: The other group is nicer; It makes me feel sad and angry; I'll find another friend.

I would be nice to them. Reasons for liking this choice: Because I want to remain friends.

I will talk it out with them. Reasons for liking this choice: If I talk we won't fight; He won't mess with me again—I'll solve the problem.

I will walk away from them. Reasons for liking this choice: So we can remain friends; They might hit me; I won't have to tell the teacher.

Tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: Because it will hurt my feelings; So they won't mess with me again; So nothing bad will go down.

Group #3

*I will still treat them nice. Reasons for liking this choice: I would like to just teach them how to be respectful; It's better to be nice and kind; They need to learn rules on how to be nice and treat others; I wouldn't want to get in trouble like them and be a bad person/bully.

I will work it out. Reasons for liking this choice: I will talk it out because I can't tell the teacher unless I talk about it; If I didn't they will be mad at me; They won't be mean anymore and they will be nice to you like you are nice to others.

I will just work with someone else/Find another partner. Reasons for liking this choice: Because another person will be nice; They will treat you nice and better; They will not make me sad.

I will tell the teacher. Reasons for liking this choice: The teacher can help you work it out; She will tell them what's right and wrong; She will give them a warning and clip you down.